

DATE: \_\_\_\_\_

①

DATE: \_\_\_\_\_

## Instructions

## QUESTION NO 03

1. Give numbering to headings

ROLE OF CIVIL SERVICE REFORM  
IN IMPROVING GOVERNANCE

2. Do not write lengthy paragraphs. Write medium sized paragraphs with headings

3. There should be around 15 headings for 20 marks question.

## INTRODUCTION

4. Draw figures/diagram/flowchart where needed.

5. Start new question from fresh page.

6. Each answer should start with Introduction and end with Conclusion.

7. Give more weightage to expressly asked parts of the question.

8. Change colour scheme for references to give them more visibility.

9. Manage time well.

10. Wide page borders are discouraged. Should be reasonable.

11. Avoid writing wrong references.

Civil service reforms are vital to improve the governance in Pakistan. This is because Pakistan inherited civil service from British. Civil service introduced in sub continent aimed to produce civil servants for protection of ruler not for safeguarding the interests of public. Therefore, civil services in Pakistan, which is inherited from British, does not comply with modern forms of good governance. Hence reforms were vital many attempts were made for civil service reforms but expected outcomes were not obtained due to bureaucratic resistance, elite capture, lack of e-governance, political unwillingness and economic issues confronting the state.

## CIVIL SERVICE REFORMS AND THEIR ROLE IN IMPROVING GOVERNANCE IN PAKISTAN

### a) AMENDMENT IN CIVIL SERVICE EFFICIENCY RULES AND THEIR IMPACTS

Civil service efficiency rules are amended in Pakistan time to time. These rules improved the governance in Pakistan by enhancing the efficiency of civil services in Pakistan.

### b) REFORMS RELATED TO ACCOUNTABILITY AND THEIR IMPACTS

Likewise reforms associated with accountability of civil servants were made to ensure the transparency in public dealings and efficient delivery. NAB and FIA ordinances in this regard are among the major efforts for ensuring transparency in Pakistan's civil servants.

## C- REFORMS TO DECREASE POLITICAL INTERFERENCE AND THEIR IMPACT ON SERVICE DELIVERY

Various reforms for making the bureaucracy independent of political interference were made. These reforms had various political implications yet ~~they~~ they increased the service delivery. For example, in KP, the police was made accountable to its official rather than politicians. This improved the service delivery and KP police became competent in decreasing the crime rate. Extra judicial killings were decreased and <sup>were</sup> lower than in Punjab and Sindh. This shows that reforms were sufficient to change the face of civil services.

## d- REFORMS RELATED TO E-GOVERNANCE AND THEIR IMPACTS

Likewise various reforms related to e-governance were introduced which yielded positive results. For example, NADRA services

were digitalized through applications and decrease in rush was observed in NADRA offices. People were able to get their NIC, B forms and other NADRA documents while sitting in their homes. Similarly, the citizen portal introduced by government proved vital in solving the issues of general public and ensuring good governance.

### WHY REFORMS HAS YIELDED LIMITED SUCCESS

Although various reforms are introduced by the state time to time, these reforms have yielded limited results due to,

#### a) POLITICAL UNWILL

and reluctance to implement the reform efforts is the major cause of limited success of these reforms. For the sake of political good will, politicians become herculean in implementation of these reforms.

## (b) ELITE CAPTURE AND UNSUCCESSFUL REFORMS

Elite capture is another issue through which reforms are shaped in such a way that benefit the elite and not the general public, leading to limited success of the reforms.

## (c) POLICY CAPTURE AND UNSUCCESSFUL REFORMS

Policy capture, through which reforms are molded by bureaucrats for their benefits is another issue which makes the reforms unsuccessful.

## (d) POLITICAL INSTABILITY AND UNSUCCESSFUL REFORMS

Political instability is another issue due to which reforms are not materialized and full benefits are not obtained through the reforms.

## (f) - ECONOMIC ISSUES AND UNSUCCESSFUL REFORMS

issues along with economic <sup>political</sup> crises also lead to unsuccessful reforms, as reforms are not materialized due to lack of finances.

## (g) - BUREAUCRATIC RESISTANCE TO E-GOVERNANCE

Bureaucratic resistance to e-governance is another issue, due to which civil servants oppose the e-governance reform by the state.

## ROLE OF POLITICAL INTERFERENCE AND PATRONAGE NETWORKS

Conclusion is missing.

Political interference coupled with patronage networks is another issue which leads to unsuccessful reforms. Politicians interfere in affairs of civil servants for the political benefits. This interference is coupled with patronage networks, which impact efficiency of reforms.

## QUESTION NO 05

### INTERGOVERNMENTAL RELATIONS AND 26<sup>TH</sup> AND 27<sup>TH</sup> AMENDMENT AND PUBLIC SERVICE DELIVERY AND FORMULATION

#### INTRODUCTION

Intergovernmental relations refers to relation among state institutions like executive, judiciary and legislative. These relations have a huge impact on public service delivery and policy formulation. Recent constitutional amendments, 26<sup>th</sup> and 27<sup>th</sup> constitutional amendment, changed the dynamics of intergovernmental relations by providing a edge to legislative and judiciary and by curbing the wings of executive. These amendments, at one end, enhance the executive and legislative to execute and make the policies related to public good and limit judiciary to interfere in case public service or policy formulation is not according to the public interest.

## (A) ENVIRONMENTAL RIGHTS TO PUBLIC

By virtue of Article 9(A), inserted in constitution of Pakistan through 26<sup>th</sup> constitutional amendment, environmental rights and right to clean environment are given to general public. Thus these amendments bind the policy formulation to be environment centric. Thus these amendments also increase the circle of services to the environment related services as well, enhancing the scope of public service delivery.

## (B) END OF SUO MOTTO AND IMPACTS: IN PUBLIC SERVICE DELIVERY AND POLICY FORMULATION

26<sup>th</sup> constitutional amendment took back the right of suo motto from ESP and granted this right to constitutional bench. Suo motto was one of the most powerful tool to ensure the public service delivery in case governmental institutions were lacking interest. This also

DATE: \_\_\_\_\_

(9)

DAY: \_\_\_\_\_

led to affect the policy formulation as due to lack of *Suo motu* supreme court ~~was~~ is no more able to intervene in public policy formulation process.

**CHANGED**  
**(C) PROCESS OF CJP SELECTION AND ITS IMPACT ON PUBLIC POLICY FORMULATION AND SERVICE DELIVERY**

likewise, the process of CJP selection has been changed. Initially, the top most senior judge of supreme court become the CJP. But after the 98<sup>th</sup> constitutional amendment, CJP would be made by selecting one judge from top 3 judges. Thus, process of CJP selection is now dependent on legislative. This would limit the judicial interference by top most judges in legislative and executive affair giving a free hand to legislative to formulate policy at its will and similarly, the executive will also be have no check by judiciary in public service delivery.

## d- PERFORMANCE EVALUATION OF JUDGES BY PARLIMENT - AND LACK OF JUDICIARY <sup>INTERVENTION</sup> IN POLICY FORMULATION AND PUBLIC SERVICE DELIVERY

Now after the 26<sup>th</sup> constitutional amendment, legislative is given the power to evaluate the judges performance, this will also lead to lack of intervention by judiciary in governance and policy formulation process.

## e- JUDGES POSTING WITHOUT CONSENT AND LACK OF JUDICIAL INTERFERENCE IN GOVERNANCE AND POLICY FORMULATION

likewise, judges are now viable to posting in any highest court without their will or consent. Thus, this will also led to lack of judicial interference in public policy formulation in good governance.

DATE: \_\_\_\_\_

(17)

DAY: \_\_\_\_\_

## F- CONSTITUTIONAL BENCHES AND PUBLIC POLICY FORMULATION AND GOVERNANCE

Now constitutional benches are made, through which the constitutional questions would be addressed. Before these amendments, Supreme court had to listen to all cases but now constitutional cases would be listened by constitutional court, providing more time to Supreme court for focusing on issues related to good governance. But at the other hand, it limits the legislative affairs to constitutional bench, selected by government, giving government a free hand to make policy.

## G- INCREASING VALUE LIMIT OF SUPREME COURT CASES

Value limit of Supreme court is now enhanced to 10 million, so only limited number of cases would be now heard by Supreme court. This would also limit the SC impacts on governance.

CURBING  
JUDICIAL  
WINGS

- REMOVING SUO MOTTO
- + JUDICIAL TRANSFERS
- + CJP APPOINTMENT

END OF  
JUDICIAL  
ACTIVISM

CAN BE  
GOOD

- + GOOD POLICIES CAN BE MADE
- + NO HURDLES IN IMPLEMENTATION

POLICY  
FORMULATION  
WITHOUT  
INTERFERENCE

CAN BE  
BAD

- + BAD POLICIES CANNOT BE CHALLENGED
- + NO JUDICIAL AUTHORITY TO HASHTLY QUESTION BAD GOVERNANCE

## QUESTION NO 06

### EFFECTIVENESS OF CITIZEN LED ACCOUNTABILITY IN PAKISTAN

#### INTRODUCTION

Citizen led accountability is one of the major mechanisms to ensure transparency in public service delivery. Citizen led accountability exists in Pakistan but its effectiveness is not up to the mark. Certain factors like economic fragility and political instability are major cause that led to failure or ineffectiveness of citizen led accountability in Pakistan. Social indicators like in education, health and justice show that Pakistan lack behind the many states which show that citizen led accountability is not playing effective role in social development and public service delivery. This has also led to failure in governance and other related issues.

DATE: \_\_\_\_\_

14

DAY: \_\_\_\_\_

## VARIOUS INDICATORS SHOW THAT CITIZEN LED ACCOUNTABILITY IS NOT EFFECTIVE IN GOVERNANCE IN PAKISTAN

Various indicators show that citizen led accountability is not as effective in Pakistan as it should be. For example 2.5 million students in Pakistan are out of the school. Health indicators also show that health governance is also not effective as Pakistan's ranking in global health index is substantially low. Same is the case of public service delivery. In world judicial ranking, Pakistan is at 119 out of 125 countries. All these indicators show that governance is not effective despite being proclaimed accountability mechanisms including citizen led accountability. Hence, as per these indicators, governance is not effective or up to the mark.

## WHY HEALTH AND EDUCATION POLICY IS NOT SUCCESSFUL IT SHOWS WEAK SOCIAL INDICATORS

Number of factors are responsible for weak weak social indicators in health and education.

### (a) EXCLUSION OF MAIN STAKE-HOLDERS

In both health and education sectors, main stakeholders are neglected. Opinion of field workers is either completely ignored or is not given due share in policy formulation. For example, teachers teaching at various levels are not taken in account while designing public policy related to education. Similarly, doctors, nurses and paramedic staff are not given due importance in designing the health policy. This leads to a gap between theoretical understandings and practicality of an issue. This leads to policy failure and ultimately low social indicators.

## b- LESS ECONOMIC SPENDINGS ON HEALTH AND EDUCATION LEADS TO WEAK SOCIAL INDICATORS

Less budgetary budgetary spendings are made on health and education. Pakistan spend approximately 5% budgetary spendings of both health and education combined. This leads to weak social indicators in health and education sectors of Pakistan.

## c- POLITICAL INTERFERENCE IN HEALTH AND EDUCATION SECTOR

Political interference in health and education sectors is another major cause that leads to weak social indicators. For example, according to a report by dawn, Education sector in Pakistan is mostly exploited for ghost and political appointments by politicians. Same is the case of ghost schools. Story of health sector is not different where many ghost doctors and hospitals still exist.

## CONCLUSION

Though there is a mechanism of citizen led governance and accountability in Pakistan, but economic and political factors are the major causes of weak social indicators in health and education.

## QUESTION NO 07

### E-GOVERNANCE IS NOT COMPLETELY SUCCESSFUL IN PAKISTAN

#### INTRODUCTION

21<sup>st</sup> century is the century of technology. E-governance or electrical governance refers to use of ICT for governance. E-governance is mainly used in modern days in developed state to ensure good governance. Various e-governance initiatives are taken by the government but these has not yielded significant result in Pakistan. Major causes of this are ~~elite~~ Bureaucratic

reluctancy, Digital divide, low knowledge of cyber security.

### (A) BUROCRATIC RELUCTANCE TO TECHNOLOGY

One major cause of less success rate of e-governance is burocratic reluctance to accept and adopt the modern technology. Burocratic reluctance is due to ~~the~~ the aptitude in burocratic circles that technology can expose the burocratic inefficiency.

### (B) DIGITAL DIVIDE AND LESS EFFECTIVE E-GOVERNANCE

There exists a digital divide in Pakistan where rural areas are not equipped with desired e-technology like smart phones and internet while urban areas are equipped with technology. This creates a rural urban divide. Due to this rural urban divide, equal opportunities are not provided to rural and urban areas thus e-governance can lead to a discrimination.

## (C) LACK OF CYBER AWARENESS

Lack of cyber awareness is another issue. As ~~most~~ <sup>majority</sup> of the public of the public is not aware about cyber safety, ~~they~~ this can lead to misuse of cyber technology and hence it impedes efficiency of e-governance.

### WAY FORWARD

