

Question No. 1.

Shift from traditional Government to modern governance:-

Traditional governments were more focused on State Controlled governance, wherein state had complete control over markets, Policy making and Planning, without focusing on Public Participation or accountability.

In the era of 1950s, when industrialization was at its Peak and Countries of ~~the~~ Global North were developing rapidly, it was considered that the only reason behind the development of Western Industries and economy is climate. As Global North had majority of the countries with cold weather system, while the Global South had warm weather, this difference was thought to be the actual reason that leads towards development.

Moreover, the concept of free market was introduced in Europe and America, where state had little control over the markets. However, countries like those who were members of Soviet Union had state controlled markets but still, there was not much difference in the development process of first world and second world.

Emerging Industrialization of China

Nevertheless, China completely shifted the focus i.e. Climate is responsible for development as there was rapid industrialization witnessed in it.

China in 1970s became ~~the~~ one of the largest Industries, that allowed the world to change their narrative from climate being responsible for development to Industrialization is the actual reason behind the Human Development.

Narrative of Public Service Delivery

Later, it was observed that although China became one of the largest industrialized country; however, it was still behind in human development - Thus, this made the economists to consider that the government is the better public service delivery that can actually make a difference - However, the question of how to achieve the same way still not addressed -

Douglass North's Book

Douglass North wrote a book in 1990, wherein he defined that human development is something that can only be achieved by strong institutions.

Thus, it was job of institutions who were responsible to ensure the human development through the service delivery including education, health and other necessary facilities.

World Bank

Thus, World Bank gave a definition of governance i.e. Governance is ability of the government to ~~achieve~~ utilize a country's social, economic and political resources to achieve the development. Thus, proving the six indicators through which the efficiency of governance can be measured. In this regard, traditional government was completely shifted toward modern Governance.

Role of modern Governance in Policy making in Pakistan

Policy making is the process that set the directions goals or targets of any government. Hence, it is the most critical process that ensures not only the public service delivery but also the resolution

of Public problems. However, traditional government had less focus on policy making through Participatory process. Rather, the focus was laid on State Controlled Policy making wherein, State with the help of its institutions created a policy without having it analyzed or evaluated.

Modern Governance's role in Policy making in Pakistan:

The shift towards the modern governance has allowed the governments to follow the given six procedure to make the policy effective and efficient:-

a) Problem Identification

Modern Governance have allowed the Policy making process to begin from the most critical phase i.e. identification of Problem - Thus, Civil Society, and media identify the problem that is affecting the Public directly forcing Government to focus on it.

b) Agenda Setting

Thus, after the identification of problem, another procedure of Policy making in Pakistan is bringing the ~~agenda~~ problem on agenda - It simply means that government filters out the problem in order to give or lose attention to any issue.

c) Policy Formulation

After the Agenda Setting, ~~the~~ Government in Pakistan ~~is~~ formulated the Policy - This process is completed with the involvement of all NGOs, Judiciary, legislative branch, Civil Society and executive branch to shape the policy by analyzing cost and benefits.

d) Policy Analysis

This is the most critical state which is used to ~~analyze~~ the Policy - This procedure helps in choosing the best option in Policy alternative - However, regardless of the importance of Policy analysis, Pakistan lacks thorough analysis as its done only as a formality - Policy analysis demands debates, surveys, group meeting and expert opinions to do the same.

e) Policy implementation

After the Formulation of Policy, Institution and resources are mobilized in Pakistan to effectively and efficiently implement the Policy -

f) Policy evaluation

This is the last procedure of Policy making in Pakistan. Where the audits are conducted in order to analyze the Objectives and achieved goals - This helps in finding the gaps to be addressed -

Innovative Policy making for Complex Problems

Policy making is a complex procedure needed to resolve the complex problems. To tackle Climate Change, poverty or inequalities, it is pertinent to following the procedure given below to make Policy effective and efficient -

a) Bridging between Government and Academics

Problems like Climate Change is complex as it concerns all the stakeholders including economists, scientists and Politicians. Thus, the bureaucrats of Government executes solely but formulating policy to tackle it rather Academic branch is required to be utilized -

b) use of Scientific method -

Pakistan and other developing countries lack in Scientific method usage for Policy making - Thus many core problems remain unresolved - In this regard, it is responsibility of government to deliberately use Scientific method to make Policy -

c) Policy making done by Specialists not by bureaucrats -

Problems like Poverty and Climate Change demand the Policy analysis by economists and scientists who are specialists in their field. For example, Problems of Floods can better be analyzed by specialist to guide the government how can Afforestation can help in slow down river flow - Similarly, economist can help in lowering down the economic cost -

d) Research Culture

Policy making for complex problems demand a thorough research to effectively handle the problem - for example surveys and onsite visits for research can help the government to analyse the reason behind inequality and to counter it effectively.

Pakistan's Institutional Capacity in Policy making:

Pakistan's does have robust institutions, however, country still lacks capacity in effective policy making.

For example, economic Commission of Pakistan mainly constitutes the bureaucrats, and other members of executive pillar - Rather than expert economists -

Moreover, Ministry of Planning Development in special initiatives was formulated to help in policy making.

Nevertheless, M/o PDESI failed to do the same effectively because it shifted its responsibilities to ~~PIDE~~ PIDE and it became bureaucratic centric institution.

Gap between Academia and Government

Countries like USA and UK approach universities including Oxford and Harvard to get their expert opinions for the complex problems - However, Pakistan lacks the same in its policy making.

Lack of Research Culture

Pakistan's Institutions formulate capacity whereby the policy analysis is done only as a formality in which particular expert opinions included only. Thus, Policy making remains ineffective to resolve the actual complex problems including poverty and inequality.

Question No 2

Impact of donor funding on governance:-

Pakistan's fragile economy, trade deficit and low economic growth makes it dependant on donor funding either in the form of Aid or ~~debt~~ loans. Although the donor funding sometimes saves the economy from going bankrupt, however, it also effects country's economic capability and more severely its governance.

For example, Pakistan mainly relies on International Monetary Fund to provide loan in order to run its economy. Although, it helps Pakistan to save its economy from going bankrupt however IMF also puts conditions on Pakistan to follow that directly effects its governance. Case in point is pressure from IMF to end subsidies on Petroleum increased prices of petrol and diesel. This increase in prices directly effects the poor population as not only the prices of transport increases, there is also a hike in prices of food products or clothing. Thus, it results in poor service delivery wherein the poor population strive to get the food to survive, completely ending focus on education or another necessity.

Importance of Donor funding

It is essential to highlight that Pakistan can't simply refuse the donor funding, because due to problems like severe floods in 2022 and 2025, there was loss of billions of dollars to country's economy. Whereas, its poor population was not only homeless

It also required food, health care facilities and other basic life necessities. Thus, it made obligatory for Pakistan to approach the international institutions or other countries to provide either Aid or loans in order to rehabilitate its poor population and to reestablish the infrastructure to ensure connectivity.

Hence, foreign funding is also a necessity for Pakistan during such catastrophic disasters to rehabilitate its people and economy.

Problems Caused by external funding in governance :-

However, foreign Aid comes with conditions that affect the governance in Pakistan. One in point is that IMF demands imposition of more taxes on goods and services in order to generate enough revenue to pay back the loan with interest or increase the tax collection of Government.

However, these taxes not only affect the majority of population but also affect the service delivery. For example, a middle class person whose salary is already below the requirement is forced to pay more taxes. Thus, it will affect his ability to provide quality education to his children or even basic nutritious necessities for infant for their mental growth.

Moreover, Pakistan's another problem is unemployment. There are almost or more than six million unemployed people currently existing. However, IMF forces the country to reduce size of the government by ending the services of the government employees without providing any

alternative- Although, rightsizing is a necessary step to lower the burden on Government - But without enhanced SMEs or robust private sector, rightsizing will only increase the number of unemployed in Pakistan.

Positive impacts of donor funding on Governance:-

Although the donor funding have adverse impact on governance, however few positive effects are given below:-

a) Accountability

The institutions who provide loans like IMF demand Accountability in the country - Thus Government are forced to take action against corruption and ensure effective use of resources.

b) Transparency

IMF also demands transparency from government of Pakistan - Thus the government has to show the clear picture of actual figures to its people regarding its performance in service delivery or corruption control.

c) Broadening tax net

Another pressure built by IMF or World Bank is broaden the tax net in order to minimize tax evasion.

Thus, Governments are forced to ~~take~~ take necessary steps to minimize the tax fraud and significant improvement is noted in this regard.

Impact of external assistance on Institutions

To understand the the effects of external assistance on Institutions, following merits attention:-

a) Strengthening National Accountability Bureau

Foreign aid or loan comes with conditions ~~of~~ to ensure accountability in the country - Thus the institution responsible for Accountability i.e NAB

is strengthened to ensure the accountability and control committee in order to fulfill the condition of IMF.

b) Strengthening Federal Board of Revenue:

Another major condition of the ~~the~~ International organization who pay the loans ~~is~~ is broadening the tax net of country. Thus, main institution responsible for tax ~~is~~ collection i.e. FBR is strengthened by the government to bring the ~~is~~ those under the tax net who are involved in ~~embroidered~~ tax fraud.

c) Weakening Institutions responsible for Public Service Delivery:

However, the institutions like Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Commerce or ~~other~~ ~~the~~ Ministry of Health and Education who are responsible to give relief to the public, enhance trade, provide better health and quality education, are restricted due to the conditions of IMF or other organizations. Thus, it affects the service delivery and economic growth of country.

Impact of external assistance on Policy implementation:

If the country relies on external assistance, then its policy making also becomes dependent on their instructions.

For example, the problems identified by the civil society and media in Pakistan ~~is~~ remain unresolved or ~~is~~ don't even achieve to agenda setting of government because of condition of foreign institution like IMF who restrict the government to ~~is~~ enforce any such step. Thus, external assistance ~~is~~ ~~is~~ affects the policy implementation in the country.

Question No 3

Role of civil service reforms in governance outcomes:

Civil servants or bureaucrats are mainly responsible for providing better service delivery, ensuring the law and order and providing basic necessities to the people of any country.

Hence, civil service reforms are necessary to align them according to the better governance indicators - for example, if Climate Change is posing the largest threat to Pakistan as highlighted ~~by~~ in the book Pakistan 9 half century that says that if the floods remain for next few decades, they can undo Pakistan. Thus, this threat require an immediate attention to be resolved, which is done by the help of civil servants.

However, in Ministry of Science and Technology, Ministry of Climate Change or Ministry of Economic Affairs, all are filled with the bureaucrats of general nature. There is a requirement of specialized people who can help in policy making by their experience and specialization. However, both the students of Arts and Science are filled in every institutions, without analyzing their expertise.

Thus, ^{civil servant} governance reforms are necessary to improve the governance outcomes.

Moreover, Civil Service reforms can help in ~~recruiting~~ the recruiting the Civil

not only on basis of exams but Skill too - The effort can help in recruiting the skillful civil service and posting them in their respective area for better service delivery, rule of law and better economic growth - -

Reasons behind limited success

Although repeated attempts have been made, however these efforts yielded limited success, due to following reasons:

1. Generalization

The biggest problem that remains unresolved in the civil servants reforms is ending the generalization -

This means that not every civil servant can be posted anywhere rather only the subject specialist can work in respective department.

2. Promotion based on Presence

Despite repeated efforts, promotion of civil servants is still based upon their presence in the office. There is no such mechanism introduced to increase the salary or promote the servant on basis of performance. This step demotivate the hardworking civil servants.

3. No Key Performance Indicators

There are still not ~~the~~ key Performance Indicators introduced in the civil service that can determine the productivity of civil servant on the basis of which he shall get benefit or face the consequence. Absence of KPI provides motivation to incorable civil servants.

4. Different salary structure in federal and Provinces

The salary structure in federal and provinces of Pakistan is different. Thus, even the civil servants performing well in federal, he will still get less pay than the provincial civil servant, that demotivates and affects his performance.

5- No efforts on Skill based appointments :-

Civil servants are stills appointed on the basis of exams that they are required to qualify - Regardles of the fact that either they possess any skill to perform any Job efficiently - Thus absence of inclusion of Skill based appointment also affects the performance.

6- Training of Civil service is academic based :-

Civil servants are trained on the basis of academic rather than Skill based training - Due to which, any civil servant who gets appointed get the training (like his previous education) that is theoretical rather than being practical - Thus, untrained civil servants on jobs that demands Skill also affect the performance adversely.

Impact of Political Interference and Patronage on Public Sector performance :-

Political interference is one of the largest factor that undermines the Public Sector performance.

1- Promotion on base of service to Politicians

Civil servants who are responsible to ensure the better performance of Public sectors are forced to provide services to Politicians in order to get a promotion - This poor structure, shifts the focus of Civil servant from Public service to pleasing politicians.

2- Threat of Posting and transfers

Public servants are not provided with guarantee of Posting and transfers - These transfers are in the hand of Politicians or under their seniors - Thus any action against the wish of seniors or Politician results in immediate transfer to remote areas -

3. ~~Effecting~~ Effecting justice and equality:

Public service are provided with limited powers to ensure equality. If a civil servant wished to apprehend the criminal from elite class, he gets transferred or his promotion stops. Thus, he ensures limited equality.

4. Reduced Power of bureaucrats:

Continuous efforts of political governments reduced the powers of bureaucrats to perform efficiently. For example, Powers of District Magistrate were given to Zila/District Nazim. These reduction of powers practices result in less service delivery.

Conclusion

As mentioned in view, civil service reforms are necessary for improvement of governance. In this regard, multiple efforts have been made. However, it has yielded limited success because the core problems remain unresolved. Furthermore, political interference also become the hurdle in public sector performance.

