Subjective Part - Part II

Q#3

The formation of new provinces is a recurring discourse in Pakistan... give recommendations.

Introduction:

Pakistan consists of seven administrative units comprising Islamabad capital territory, Gilgit Baltistan, Azad Jammu and Kashmir and four provinces. Administrative structure of pakistan is divided into capital, provinces, divisions, districts, tehsils and union councils. All provinces have their own culture and traditions.

In addition to provincial identities i.e., Punjabi, Sindhi, Balochi, Pashtun etc, there are several regional identities in provinces such as Hazarawal in Hazara division of kpk, saraiki in the multan division of Punjab, and Mohajir in the karachi. These regional allege disenfranchisement during budget allocations, and in respect of employment opportunities and developmental works.

The demand for creating new provinces is increasing in Pakistan since the passage of 18th Amendment which gave greater autonomy to provinces within the fedral structure.

Popular Demands:

1- **Punjab** (Demanding saraiki and Bahawal pur provinces):

The proponents of the saraiki and Bahawalpur provinces expect that their provinces will get a quota in federal services. Presently, Punjab has **50%** quota in the federal services and most of the jobs go to the upper and central punjab as candidates from southern Punjab are unable to compete for these job. The **disparity** in the quality of education or jobs in these regions of Punjab is a major cause for this.

2. **KPK** (Demanding Hazara Province)

The 18th Amendment calls for the control of the resources by the provinces itself. This offers a lot to the Hazara region as it can earn a lot through royalties on hydropower projects, dams and mineral resources it owns. But in the case of the south Punjab province, the situation is not the same due to its **agro-based economy**.

3. **Sindh** (Demanding Karachi / urdu speaking province):

As regards Sindh, the issue of dividing it into two or more provinces is very sensitive. The local Sindhi population will not accept it as they are very much emotional about their provincial boundaries.

4. **Balochistan** (Pashtun Belt):

Though the demand of separate province by Pashtun speaking people of the province is not on the table yet it could be heard in the future if new provinces ~~were~~ are made else where.

Core of the debate:

The proposed 27th amendment has triggered a national debate: should Pakistan resolve its governance challenges by creating 12 new provinces?

⇒ Hurdles in making new provinces in Pakistan:

1. Legal hurdles:

Under article 239(4) any alteration requires two-third majority in the relevant provincial assembly before parliament even consider the amendment. After that, both houses of Parliament must again pass the measure with a two-third vote. In the present climate of political fragmentation, reaching such a consensus is almost impossible, making the "new provinces" path politically unworkable.

2- The Timing challange:

At this time, Pakistan is slowly transitioning from stabilization to a fragile path of growth and reform. At a time when national focus must remain on economic stability, embarking on structural boundary changes could **destablize** markets and increase political uncertainty

3- Administrative overload:

New provinces are not just lines on a map. They mean:

- Division of assests and liabilities
- Restructuring of police and courts.
- Reassigning civil servants
- Redrawing electoral constituencies
- Managing inter-provincial disputes

These processes would consume years of energy, drag the judiciary into endless litigation and paralyze governance.

4- The Fiscal cost of extra capitals:

Each new province would demand a cheif minister's office, cabinet, secretariat, assembly, official residences, vehicles, staff and security protocols. These expenses would ~~permo~~ permanently inflate government, when already Pakistan is struggling with **fiscal crisis.**

5- **Decision Making Problems:**

With more provinces, decision making at key intergovernmental bodies like the **CCI, NFC and NEC** would become slower and more contentious.

6. **The buisness and market impact:**

For the private sector, multiplying provinces means more jurisdictions, tax regimes, and compliance requirements. Firms operating nation wide would have to file multiple tax returns, follow different rates and navigate more regulators. This would increase the cost of doing buisness, discourage investment and damage Pakistan's competitiveness.

7- Risk of uneven development:

Craving new provinces would not resolve inequalities, it could sharpen them. Wealthein areas like Peshawar and Hazara in KP, Quetta in Balochistan, or Central Punjab could thrive, while less developed districts in the same new provinces would lag far behind. Instead of bridging gaps, this could widen intra-regional disparities.

⇒ It would also increase water disputes and would also encourage more ethnic movements.

Recomendations

The more promising path is to recast Article 140-A to mandate provinces to establish empowered local govt. with clearly defined functions, authority and financing.

→ What the Local Government list should cover:

The local list should grant LGs control over:

- Primary and secondary education up to matric
- District hospitals and basic health care.
- Water supply, sewerage and solid waste.
- Roads, bridges and local transport with in districts
- Population planning and social welfare.
- Sports, youth and community development.

All staff up to Grade 16 working in these sectors should be transferred to LGs, with their salary budgets included. This ensures local governments have the human and financial resources to actually deliver.

(9)

Fiscal devolution and Own Revenues:

Financial empowerment is the backbone of real devolution.

- PFCs must allocate **30-40%** of provincial NFC shares directly to LGs.
- LGs should be able to collect property tax, agricultural tax, cesses, ~~an~~ fees and user charges, spending them locally.
- Auditing of LG account should remain under the Auditor General of pakistan to ensure transparency.

Roadmap for implementation:

A practical road map could roll out within 12-18 months.

First 3 months: pass the amendment, finalize the local Government List and draft model rule of buisness.

Next 6 months: Notify PFC awards, transfer assets and staff and prepare for LGs elections.

CamScanner

(10)

Months 9-12: Pilot service delivery in major cities like Lahore, and Karachi.

Months 12-18: Expand to all districts, publish citizen scorecards, and conduct the first round of independent LG audit.

Conclusion:

The 27th amendment debate highlights a cross road for Pakistan's federation. Creating new provinces is politically improbable, administratively heavy, and fiscally damaging. Empowering Local Governments through constitutional clarity, strong financial backing and professional management is cheaper, faster and far more effective. True devolution under Article 140A and a Local Govt. list can finally bring services, accountability and representation.

Q#4

There is a dangerous revival of militancy... give recommendations.

Militancy in Kpk and Balochistan has resurfaced dangerously in recent years. This issue is complex, rooted in regional, political and social factors.

Reasons:

1- **Afghan Factor:**

After the Taliban regained power in Afghanistan, many Pakistani militants found shelter and support across the border. Weak border control allow them to move, plan and attack.

2- **Re-emergence of militant groups:**

Groups like the TTP, ISIS-K, and BLA ~~have~~ are reorganized and expanded. Each has its own religious, ethnic etc goals.

3- **Political Instability:**

Constant political chaos and

weak governance give militants room to operate.

4- **Local Grievances:**

In Balochistan, people feel deprived of their rights, resources and political voice. Heavy-handed military operations and missing persons have deepened anger and mistrust among locals.

5 **Poor economy and Unemployment:**

Poverty, joblessness and lack of **education** push many young people towards militancy. Criminal networks and smuggling also help finance these groups.

6- **India's role:**

India also encourage such groups in Pakistan and may be ~~be~~ it also finance them.

7- **Weak-counter narrative:**

Extremist ideas spread quickly through social media and religious networks, while the

State's counter message remains weak and inconsistent.

Recommendations

1- **Intelligence based action:**
Focus on precise, well planned operations that target militant leaders, not civilians.

2- **Border management:**
Strengthen the security and check and balance on all borders.

3- **Political dialogue:**
Address Baloch grievances through dialogue, fair resource sharing and ending enforced disappearances. political inclusion can do what force alone cannot.

4- **Economic and educational development:**
Create jobs for local youth through CPEC projects, vocational training and quality schooling to reduce the attraction of

militancy in youth.

5- **Counter extremist ideology:**
Promote peace education, regulate madrasas and use media to spread tolerance and unity.

Conclusion:

The revival of militancy is not just a security problem. It is a political, social and economic failure. Guns alone cannot bring peace. Pakistan needs a balanced approach like Smart security, Justice, economic inclusion and sincere political dialogue to end the cycle of voilence in Kpk and Balochistan.

Q#5

Trump once again... the world leader.

The U.S. withdrawl from the paris climate agreement is a major set back for global climate efforts. As the world's largest economy and second biggest polluter, America, exit the agreement, this weakens global unity, funding and momentum against climate change.

Impacts:

1- Loss of leadership:

Without the U.S., international cooperation becomes weaker. Many countries may slow their climate goals, seeing less pressure or support.

2- Funding Gap:

The U.S. was a big contributor to climate funds for poor countries. Its withdrawl means less money for adaptation and clean energy in developing nations.

3- ~~Rise of other powers:~~

3- **Shift in leadership:**

This can result in shift in leadership. another power like EU or china may take the lead and replace U.S. in a good way.

Recommendations:

- Others countries should stay united and strengthen their cooperation under the paris agreement.
- The EU, china and allies must try to fill the leadership and finance gap left by the U.S.
- Encouragement of American states, cities and industries to keep working on clean energy and emission cuts.
- Promoting of global trade rules that reward green production and penalize pollution
- Pakistan should persuade Trump to again join the agreement.