

Q3. Introduction -

There creation of new provinces has remained a constant demand throughout all period. Ineffective administration, large population, uneven distribution of resources, ethnic divides are the reasons of the recurrence of this demand. Pakistan is a country of 232 Million people, a country this big of population has various demographic and administrative needs which are required to be addressed properly. The overlooking of such demands and their underlying reasons makes this process more persistent. Punjab alone has the population of 127.7 million which is more than the population of various countries of the world including Mexico and Japan. It also has some linguistic divides, on the basis of which demand arise. (Saraiki and Punjabi) KPK and Sindh has various linguistic and ethnic divides. Balochistan holds a major part of territory. ~~But~~ Though the article 239 of the constitution provides legal process for boundary alteration yet the political grievance, political and individual interests has worked as a blockade in settling these demands. These

demands can be tackled with various models such as administrative, ethno linguistic and other division based models.

Proposed Provinces for Division

1. Punjab:

Punjab holds the population of 127.7 Million having various minor but two major linguistic groups i.e. Saraiki and Punjabi. The demand is to divide Punjab in:

i Southern Punjab: Also Saraikistan, mainly consisting of Saraiki speakers involving divisions like Bahawalpur, Multan and Dera Ghazi Khan...

ii Western Punjab: Although the proposed names would be different but it would mainly be consisted of Punjabis incorporating areas like Faisalabad and Sahiwal -

2. Sindh:

Various models were proposed for Sindh but the two of the prevailed

models includes:

i Bipartite Division: Creation of Jinnahpore (Hyderabad + Karachi) and the Rural Sindh.

ii Tripartite Division: Division of Karachi into 2 parts and attaching Hyderabad with one of the two. 3rd province would be rest of the Sindh.

This division can also be called Rural and Urban divide majority on ethnic, lingual basis.

3. Khyber Pakhtun Khan.

Since the province has been renamed from NWFP to KPK, uprisals demanding a separate province for Hindko speakers was raised. As the renaming of KPK was perceived as an identity threat by other ethnicities.

i Malakand Division (Northern Highlands)

ii Dera Ismael Khan (Southern Plains)

iii Central KP - Peshawar based province.

iv Hazara Division.

4 Balochistan

For better administrative purpose Balochistan was to be divided in two as also mentioned by IPRI -

i Quetta Division

ii Kalat Division

5 AJK and GB

Various processes and steps are to be included to make AJK and GB provinces. One scenario is leaving AJK as it is and ~~Informing~~ Consulting UN regarding the upgradation of GB to provincial level.

Constitutional Provisions for New Provinces.

Constitution of 1973

Constitution of 1973 allows a government of Pakistan to create new provinces. But the process includes an agreement of 2/3rd majority of the respective assembly on the

proposed Bill. Then it would have to pass through 2 houses. Lastly assent of President is required. It is stated in the clause 4 of Article 239.

18th Amendment

18th Amendment of 2010 provides provinces the autonomy to settle political unrest. But the socio-political issues and the ethnic-linguistic and administrative ineffectiveness was not addressed fuelling up the demand of New provinces.

Merits of New Provinces

Population Growth - a Strain on Government

• Punjab

In 1972 census the population of Punjab was recorded above 32 Million while in 2023 census it increased to 127.7 Million. Making effective governance extremely challenging.

• Sindh - 1972 census records Sindh

population about 10.5 Million now it has increased to 50.5 Million as per consensus 2023 with Karachi alone occupying more than 20 Million people -

Although the population has increased but ^{enough} administrative units weren't created

• KPK.

In 1972 population was 10.1 Million.

In 2023 it was recorded to be 40.1 Million.

• Balochistan.

The population in 1972 was ^{2.3} ~~10.4~~ Millions.
In 2023, it raised to 10.4 Million.

Dispersed population make effective governance hard for government.

The Distance Factor in terms of Law and Order.

The peripheral territories are far from the centre. People have to commute long distances for basic administrative and legal work.

For instance the people from Gawadar, Makran, Naseerpur and Chaman travels to Quetta.

From South Waziristan, Bahawalpur to Peshawar

From D.G. Khan, Bahawalnagar, Murree to Lahore -

Ineffectiveness of Local Government.

The ineffectiveness of local government increases the demand for new provinces.

Small Provinces lead to Strong Federation.

^{small} Small provinces enough for their administration makes a strong federation since they won't demand for separation.

Settlement of ethnic and Linguistic ~~Dis~~ Grievances.

Small provinces will resolve the administrative issues relieving the tension among various ethnic and linguistic groups.

Reasons why New Provinces should not be made.

- i Economic Concerns - Pakistan is facing

a hard time in keeping its economy stable. Creation of new provinces will require setting up of various new institutions such as High Court, taxation and secretariats etc which will require high amount of money.

Punjabi will Dominate.

Punjabi speaking population will dominate as compared to other ethnicities. It will dominate in both houses especially senate where seats are fixed on territory.

Constitutional Limitation

Article 239 (4) of the constitution states that a majority of $\frac{2}{3}$ rd is required from the respective provincial assembly and also from both houses which seems like an unlikely effort achievement and wastage of efforts and resources.

Political and Personal Gains.

Governments of one province supports the creation of new provinces in provinces other than its own. Since the

creation of new province in another province increases its vote bank while the creation in its own reduces its vote bank. For instance the PPP supports creation of southern Punjab but not Jammu & Kashmir.

Unfit Example of Indian Units

Division -

Since India is not a classic federal state but it is a union with certain characteristics of federation hence the creation of new provinces was an easier task.

Ethno-Lingual Basis -

Creation of provinces ~~might~~ on the basis of ethnicity and linguistics will further aggravates the tension between the provinces and federation. Giving ethnicity more value over nationality.

Conclusion.

Lack of administrative efficiency, uneven distribution of resources, aggravated grievances of ethnic and lingual minorities raises the demands of

Date _____

Day _____

Date _____

new provinces. Pakistan will have to face many hurdles such as lengthy constitutional procedure and economic and political instability in the making of new provinces. However, the creation of new provinces will lead to effective administrative units since the administration will only have territory and people which it can tackle instead of being overburdened. Most of the ethno-lingual problems surface from uneven distribution of resources and ineffective governance, this issue would also be resolved. The economic cost of setting up new institutions is very high which Pakistan can't afford in this economic unstable era of its. Hence it requires a less costly solution which is the renting of and acquiring of apartments or building and setting up courts and respective institutions there rather than the large buildings from colonial era. All of these will help in settling such demands hence reducing the grievances and making the federation stronger and people united.