

①

Day: \_\_\_\_\_

## NOA-Mock 3

Date: 11.07.24

## Pakistan Affairs

## Question 8 Answer:

## 1. Introduction

The Government of India Act 1935 resulted in the 1937 Provincial Elections. The elections were dominated by Indian National Congress (INC), depicting their strong election machinery. Congress formed ministries in 7 provinces (5 majority and 2 coalition). The All India Muslim League failed to win the majority of Muslim seats by obtaining a mere 109 seats out of 482 seats, thus losing their claim of being the sole representative of Muslims. The Congress ministries during 1937 till 1939 was an eye opener for all Muslims. INC promoted Hindu culture and values, disregarded Muslim values, imposed ban on Muslim public demonstrations in

2

Day: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Certain areas, promoted Hindu-oriented education, made singing of "Bande Mataram" mandatory, and reverence was to be paid to Gandhi. The Congress rule resulted in the final parting of ways between Muslim League and INC and eventually led to the demand of separate Muslim homeland in 1940 under the Lahore Resolution.

## 2. Oppressive Congress Rule 1937-39

The Congress rule felt like the Hindu Raj as Muslims were oppressed, deprived of their rights, and were forced to follow Hindu culture. The events during 1937-39 polarised the Muslim and Hindu relationship and the coexistence of both ethnicities / communities was impractical.

### 2.1 Vidya Mandir Scheme

The Vidya Mandir scheme was an educational scheme that was opposed by Muslims for being

3

Day: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

highly Hindu-centric. The scheme was imposed by the government in 1939. The primary reservations of Muslims to the scheme were as follows:

### a. Hindu Religious Teachings:

The scheme introduced Hindu religious teachings, Hindu folktales, Hindu heroes. Muslims perceived this as a direct threat to their identity and feared the risk of conversion.

### b. Hindu Cultural Integration:

The scheme aimed to integrate Hindu culture with formal education.

### c. Exclusion of Islamic Teachings:

While Hindu religion and culture was integrated in the curriculum, Islamic teachings were disregarded. The exclusion was seen as disregard to Muslim interests and Muslims feared loss of identity.

## 2.2 The Wardah Scheme

The Wardah scheme was formulated by Lord Curzon and was

④

Day: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Set as the normal education curriculum. This scheme was also perceived by the Muslims as Hindu-centric and thus faced Muslim opposition due to the following reasons:

**a. Hindi as primary education language:**

Muslims valued Urdu as part of their culture and Urdu was a major factor between Hindu-Muslim controversies in the past. However, the shift to Hindi as the medium of education was not perceived by Muslims as positive.

**b. Secular nature of Education:**

The Wardah Scheme emphasised secular nature of education.

A few aspects of the secular mode of education put forward teachings which were against Islamic beliefs and thus opposed by Muslims.

**2.3 Bande Mataram as National Song**

The national song was announced

5

Day: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

to be Boonde Mathram, a song written by Bankim Chatterjee in Chapter X of his book "Araadhya Math". This book was perceived as anti-Muslim as it promoted idolatry. The imposition of the song in schools as mandatory was an attack on Muslims.

## 2.4 Congress Rajas Hindu Raj

The attitude of Congress leaders towards the Muslims shifted significantly. The leaders portrayed discriminatory attitude towards the Muslims and thus Muslims began to disassociate themselves from INC.

## 2.5 Reverence paid to Gandhi and Cow Protection

Protecting and promoting Hindu culture, values, and religion became mandatory for all. The cow sacred to Hindus had to be treated in a similar way by Muslims while reverence had to be paid to Gandhi every morning.

### 3. Congress and Muslim League - Parting of Ways

The period between 1937 till 1939 was a major source of conflict among Hindus and Muslims. Muslim League especially Jinnah feared that if Congress led government is to be established in later years they would make existence of Muslims really hard.

#### 3.1 Muslim Mass Contact Program (1937)

The INC. after the elections results and weakened Muslim League position saw a political opportunity to garner support of Muslims to denounce Muslim League as Muslim representative even further and more aggressively. Therefore, in 1937, INC launched the Muslim Mass Contact Program with aim of connecting with Muslims while bypassing Muslim League. This move highly infuriated the AIML and raised their insecurity as they feared losing power. However,

7

Day: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

The program itself eventually failed. The primary reason of failure was that the oppressive congress rule between 1937-1939 was contradictory to the claim INC was making in the program.

#### 4. The Way to Separate Muslim State

The oppression of INC and political marginalisation of ML led to the ideological shift of Jinnah as coexistence of Hindus and Muslims seemed to be difficult.

#### 4.1 Jinnah's Ideological Shift

The Congress rule between 1937 and 1939 was the primary reason why the ideological shift of Jinnah came. The ambassador of Hindu-Muslim unity had practically witnessed the wrath of Hindu rule. Thus, on the day the Congress ministries resigned, 22 December 1939, Jinnah called it as "Day of Deliverance."

8

Day: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

#### 4d Demand for Separate Muslim State and Lahore Resolution 1940

The ideological shift of Jinnah and the anger of Muslims during the Congress rule of 1937 led to the demand for separate Muslim homeland put forward by the Lahore Resolution 1940.

#### 5. Analysis: Congress Ministries Paved Way for Demand of Separate Muslim Homeland

The idea of separate Muslim homeland existed before the Congress Ministries (1937). Some recall Syed Ahmed Sirhindi for bringing up the idea while some dedicate it to the Two Nation Theory of Sir Syed Ahmed Khan. However, before the Congress rule this was an idea that had practically no major ground. The reason behind this was that it was fueled by sentiment but after the Congress rule it became



9

Day: \_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

the logical solution.

## 6. Conclusion

The promotion of Hindu culture, values and religion with complete disregard to Muslim identity and restricted rights for Muslims intruded the Muslim community. The damage portrayed by INC and complete disregard of AIML during their rule led to parting of ways between two political parties. The combined sentiment now formed by logic became the eventual cause of the demand for Muslim homeland in 1940.

## Answer to Question 4

### 1. Introduction

The federal structure of Pakistan is characterised by the division of powers between the central government and provincial government. The federal form of government aims to accommodate Pakistan's diverse ethnic, linguistic and regional identities. Historically, Pakistan has switched between the parliamentary and presidential form of government since independence. Initially, Pakistan adopted the British model of parliamentary system but due to political instability and military interventions the country experienced the presidential form of government under the rule of Ayub Khan, Ziaul Haq, and Pervez Musharraf. However, the <sup>parliamentary</sup> ~~presidential~~ form of government best suits Pakistan's federal structure due to its emphasis on inclusive representation.

accountability, and flexibility, which are crucial for accommodating the diverse regional ethnicities and ensuring effective governance. Moreover, the parliamentary form of government also provides mechanism to balance powers and prevent authoritarianism which has been a problem in Pakistan's history and political culture.

## 2. The Parliamentary Form of Government

The 1973 Constitution of Pakistan established a parliamentary form of government with a federal structure. The constitution delineates the powers between the federal government and the provinces, ensuring a system of check and balances which are needed to accommodate Pakistan's diverse political environment.

In Pakistan under the parliamentary form of government the Prime Minister is the Head of Government while

the President serves as a ceremonial head. The executive (PM and Cabinet) are derived from and accountable to the legislature (Parliament).

## 2.1 Parliamentary Form of Government's Suitability to Federal Structure

### a. Representation:

A Parliamentary form of government allows for more inclusive representation of diverse provinces and political groups in decision-making process. Given Pakistan's internal diversity and regional diversity this is critical as political representation of provinces ensures that regional issues are addressed.

### b. Accountability:

The executive's dependence on legislative confidence ensures regular accountability. If the government loses the confidence of the majority in the National Assembly, it could be dismissed through vote of

No Confidence, allowing a check on power.

### C. Flexibility and Adaptability:

The parliamentary form of government often leads to coalition governments which require mutual cooperation leading to various interests being accommodated.

In addition, the ability to change leadership without a direct general election allows for a quick response to political crisis without political stability.

### 3. The Presidential Form of Government

Pakistan's 1962 Constitution was a focused on presidential form of government and Ayub Khan was the president under it. In later years the president's seat was taken by other military rulers like Zia ul Haq and Pervez Musharraf. However, after the 18th Amendment also the powers of president have been significantly restricted. The presidential system has led to authoritarianism,

Disruption of political environment, and reduced provincial autonomy, in Pakistan.

### 3.1 Presidential Form of Government's Suitability to Federal System

#### a. Stability:

The presidential system allows fixed terms for the president as the executive is not subject to the same level of legislative confidence as in the parliamentary system. This allows continuity in policies and governance.

#### b. Decisiveness:

A presidential system allows for more decisive and swift decision-making since the president doesn't need legislative approval for executive actions. This can aid in times of national emergencies when quick responses are required.

## 4 Comparative Analysis: Parliamentary vs Presidential form of Government

### 4.1 Parliamentary form of Govt: Strengths and weakness

The parliamentary system has both strengths and weaknesses as no form of government can be perfect.

#### a. Strengths:

The parliamentary form of government focuses on greater representation. The higher representation allows a more collaborative environment with an opportunity of consensus and mutual cooperation toward national issues.

Secondly, the accountability that is present in the parliamentary form of government safeguards from the risk of authoritarianism. The flexibility and public participation promotes democratic values.

### b. Weaknesses:

However, the major weakness of Parliamentary system which has been quite prevalent in the context of Pakistan as well has been political instability as this form of government can be changed frequently and the coalition dynamics become a major issue due to conflicting views.

## 5. Presidential form of government: Strengths and Weakness

### a. Strengths:

The Presidential system allows political stability due to fixed terms. In addition, due to the decision-making power situated with the President the decision-making is quick and decisive.

### b. Weaknesses:

However, The presidential form of government provides the risk for



authoritarianism due to excessive power and inability of removal which in Pakistan's case has resulted in exploitation. Furthermore, the lack of flexibility and <sup>excuse</sup> gridlock, and reduced provincial representation / autonomy. The risk is of high-level in transition to dysfunction under the presidential system.

## G. Analysis: Pakistan's Context

Evaluating the strengths and weaknesses

For both systems it can be said that

given Pakistan's political culture, need for provincial autonomy, past experience historically with presidential

system; the parliamentary form of government suits Pakistan. The parliamentary system's suitability to the federal

structure of Pakistan is also relatively

prevalent. Furthermore, Pakistan

faces rampant corruption and

political polarization both can

be solved using a parliamentary form of government.

## 7. Conclusion

The parliamentary system's emphasis on representation, accountability, and flexibility aligns well with India's

federal structure and regional

dynamics. It accommodates the country's

provincial interests while ensuring accountability

on executive power which has historically

been prone to exploitation. The

presidential system risks centralizing

power and alienating provincial

interests which could undermine

the federal structure's intent and vision.