

## SECTION - A

Question #3: Pol Culture - not developed.

### Introduction:

The political culture edifice was ruptured multiple times since Pakistan Inception. The pillars of the state are weak. Instead of strong base - federal system of government, the upper foundations are made, replaced and even destroyed. There is regional <sup>identity</sup> crises - states within states. The democracy is marred and the state tried every system of governance. The variety of political systems ranges from parliamentary system, democracy - presidential system, autocracy, Theocracy, and even 3 decades long military rule. Soon after the death of Quaid, the atrocities and leg pulling of individuals started. The game of thrones left no true room for political culture development. In short in words of Nehru: I don't change that much clothes, how much Pakistan changes its Prime ministers.

### Undeveloped political culture:

Evolution of Pakistan - Significant crossroads and reasons where political culture was set aside:

(a) The atrocities of Governor Raj:

After Independence, the Indian Act and the British left system was adopted. The neighbourly state did a breakthrough and made their own principles - constitution (permanent) and set their political discourse. While in Pakistan the power show began. The frequent changes of Governor Generals, PMs prove that. The held the constitution making process and held or <sub>back</sub>

Define political culture and give spaces between headings

abrogated the Constitution multiple time.

- (b) Ill Governance and Constitutional Development:  
 After much struggle and multiple changes in seniors from Liaqat Ali Khan, Quaid to Khwaja Nazim uddin, Chaudhary M Ali and Bogra — everyone played their role. But the Constitution took 9 yrs — 1956 which was not functional after 1.5/2 years. Later the country made another system — presidential system in order to experiment which was again dismissed in 6/7 years. Later finally in 1973 — a final constitution was adopted after a triggering point of loss of half Pakistan.
- (c) Held in Abeyance or even Abrogated with multiple am amendments: The BD system of Zia, the referendums by marshal law administrators for their sanctity played havoc.
- (d) Judiciary role and activism:  
 The decision in Mouvi Tameez uddin Case, Bhutto orders and even in Panama and current cases. The neutral Judiciary the Roof of state gets weak at first.
- (e) Wheel within a wheel — "Pakistan a Hard country — By Anatol. Pakistan faces regional identity crises. There is a state within a state — The performance of PPP in Ss in Punjab, and Muslim League in other than Punjab shows the highest form of neglect as being a Pakistan.
- (f) True democracy an utopian dream?  
 There is no democracy even within the political parties. There is no guarantee

of rights. You are free for what you say, but your freedom is not guaranteed after what you say.

(g)

Half implemented 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment:  
The devolution of power was promised from Centre → Local government. The Federal gave powers to provinces but the power nexus allure the authorities and they are not allowing the powers to be hands of local government. There is no structure and proper strong system of local government in Pakistan.

(h)

lobbying and horse trading - a new normal:  
The lobbying at floors of parliament and in decisions of Cabinets are known to all. The recent 100+ bills sewing the 8 heads are astonishing. The audio and video leaks of ministers selling the morality and public mandate for self centric interests are sad realities. The changing party ranks and floor crossings for the tickets are never held accountable.

(i)

Ill and fake promises of legislatures by public:  
Arnold in his book refers to ill practices of legislatures. The members does two promises one by public and one by the one who helps to elect them. The later is served and the democracy is kicked out of parliament.

(j)

Nepotism, Cynism and bad fated meritocracy:  
The politics is left for the show of elites. The old feudal lords became Industrialists and these Industrialists became politicians. The dream of being a parliamentarian is

left for these elites and their families.  
A common man can just hold ~~himself~~ responsible for all the problems he faces.

(K) No Concept of Opposition in Politics:

The beautiful tier of democracy, the opposition is never exercised. We either saw Alliances against military dictators - PDA and others. The opposition never seated on their seats and held accountable the ruling party in an efficient or democratic style. There was always a war among between the 2. They never respected the Public Choice.

(L) Game of Numbers and meager public will  
There is always a coalition government that leaves room for lobbying and horse trading.

You can't answer this question if you don't know the features of political culture of Pakistan.

Fake Propaganda: The game of votes on continuances along GT road and lowest average turnout ratio - 50% ± in last elections. The presence of no updated data or data base of votes and ill practices of wrong votes and selection instead of election never let Pakistan develop its political culture.

**Way forward:** Neutral bureaucracy, The complete restructuring of government. Proper strong local governments, accountability by public and free <sup>fair</sup> media. Ending the sectarian and political divide. Respecting the people and ideology of state. Democracy within ranks of parties. Autonomous bodies - judiciary, (reserve bureaus, police) - Institutions and a system of merit in politics can evolve the political culture in a proper manner.

## Section - B.

Question # 4: IMF bailout ...

**Introduction:**

Soon after the inception of Pakistan and Bretton  
~~taxi system~~ the two: Pakistan and IMF  
 are tied together. With India, <sup>not</sup> forbade any  
 further package from IMF in 1990's, we are

Make your data relevant to the  
 question being asked

still at their door step for more than 20+  
 years. The recent relief after government  
 got a package of 1.6 bn\$ - we were at edge  
 of default. With loan crossing 50 - i.e. 51.5  
 bn debt, Pakistan is left with meager  
 growth of 0.6% GDP and ever increasing load  
 of debt servicing costing half of the budget i.e. 7+ tr Rs.

Question is of general nature,  
 start your answer in the same  
 manner

Such bailout is just short term - but  
 the conditionalities of it impact every individual  
 of state. Such conditions are used by global  
 hegemonic players in order to safeguard  
 their interests in region. The recent politicized  
 Russian oil deal, the Iran-Pakistan leftover  
 gas pipeline, the halted CPEC and decreased  
 Foreign aid proves the exploitation. Similarly  
 the setback in regional politics, the devaluation  
 of \$ Rs against dollar, the highest ever inflation  
 of 31% and interest rate of 21% is clear.

The high tariffs on utility bills, petrol prices  
 hike and regime change propaganda is clear.

**The exploitative Conditionalities:**

- ① The unhappy IMF - with a slogan of  
 "DO MORE" The last year of government  
 was marred by the pressure of IMF  
 and even repeated condition to do more  
 - Ask your friends for help first. Then we will help.

We were Challenged with devastated flood causing 1/3 submerged state and 9bn loss. But instead of Aid we were backlashed for improvement.

(b) The historic Bush doctrine and the same game play: Either you are with us or against us. This statement made west holding our soil for long. The IMF being governed by such heads pushed us to the wall multiple times.

(c) Mistakes of government are more:  
Pakistan is bestowed by mighty hugging Gawadar Jewel. The 4 seasons and a terrain of beautiful Ranges. The Indus - Crown of South Asia and many resources. but the state also government was always on ventilator. and allure for aid and loans made situation bad.

(d) Debt trap by free floating \$ and Rs.  
We are tied by 54bn\$ loan. Fine of 18bn of the Iran deal is not executed. The fall of GDP and dropped remittances in last fiscal year from 31 → 25 bn.  
The half budget is gone for paying debt. The free floating currency took \$ crossing 300. Resulting in a vicious cycle of increased debt.

(e) Short lived policy implementation and no grass root transformation:  
The conditions always favoured west. The proper development and reforms are left aside and the government bombs the

- people for huge taxes and inflation.
- (f) High taxes, inflation, tax increase — with supertaxes — but never growth. The tax base is increased but the real reforms are nowhere seen. Taxing the salaried class — 200% leaving the retail market of 2000+ bn tax evaders. The total tax evasion was 4000 bn — SBP — FM. Retailers, Real estate, tobacco, Pharma and tyres and lubricant companies contribute to this. They are never made accountable. The gross root restructuring is never done.
- (g) Fiscal devolution: Never done — the budget collection/tax collection was never given to local government. The accountability of ST heads is never issued.
- (h) Simplest steps of hitting the paying public. Those who pay and file tax are exploited more and more. The mafias, non filers, the gap between de values and real property values, the importers and ill self interest based subsidies are never stopped.
- (i) Banking transactional charges and discourage the online and digital currency and freelancers. India earning 500 bn just from IT, and here we are discouraging people from bank you use. The taxes on each transaction and ever increased forms and issues of for files is encouraging black money and cashable transactions. This will hit the country even more.

## Wayforward and Conclusion :

- (a) Utilize your strategic location: Instead of looking far west. Look into your neighbour for help. — BRICS, Afghanistan, China, Iran can help Pakistan.
- (b) Utilize Regional powers and old friends Asian developmental bank, Saudi and China are always helping Pakistan and their interests are tied with us.
- (c) Restructuring the tax base and net: Accountability of tax evaders is a must. Increase the tax base by including different sectors under net without discrimination.
- (d) Utilize your assets: Utilize, Gwadar, Peshawar, mines and north — Invest on technology and tourism to attract foreigners and investment.
- (e) Directional Subsidy: Invest on skills rather than free food. Make people learn themselves and earn for themselves. Subsidies towards Renewable Energy — Solar may reduce IPO's burden. Incentivizing the IT industry and helping new ideas and incubators to encourage youth to employ more instead of being employed by exploiters.
- (f) Discourage cash and grace Taxpayers. Strict control on revenue department property tax. The elites having black money and discouraging cash flow will help us flourish more instead of Loans and Aids.



Question #6:

### Introduction:

Judicial review is a powerful control of judiciary over legislatures in order to exercise and guarantee the rights of people and uphold the Constitution. In Pakistan the judicial review is mostly politicized and biased for the need of popularity or for saving the rulers. In

Check: ref Montesquieu

Start the doctrine of necessity played its role in judicial extra activism. After the reign of it another play came in called the Suo moto.

Both the powers were exercised by 1 person alone. The recent democratic

Please give proper headings

step was taken by last government in form of provision and procedure Act 2013 in light of that instead of 1 Judge a bench will decide the matter and do judgement. But this was soon ended after the dissolution of government and parliament.

### Judicial Review:

As in case of systems of checks and balances, we borrowed the same from US in case of judicial review. In which Supreme Court judge can take a judicial review of any act or bill passed by parliament in order to secure the constitution and rights of people.

## Doctrine of Necessity and Suo moto:

By using above laws the judges played their wrong partisan role in state affairs. Doctrine of Necessity was held and taken out. But later the Suo moto was being played.

The Judicial extra activism and intervention in legislative and executive affairs badly affected the political culture of the state.

Their biasness towards parties is recently shown in Imran Khan Toshakhana Case where PTI bypassed Islamabad high court and reached Supreme court for the appeal.

Such matters badly affect the public trust of people over these pillars of state.

Kalabagh Dam and so.

The suo moto of ex Supreme Court judge over Kalabagh Dam was another judicial activism example.

Separation b/w 3 tiers is a must.

Judiciary is a neutral and autonomous body. By interference in other matters it loses its reputation and prestige.

## Practice and Procedure Act 2023

Recent Act by Parliament in order to curtail the illegal intervention of SC. And biased rulings. It was restructured and Act was formed in which a bench instead of 1 judge will do the judgement in order to have democratic and non biased judgement.

You failed to fulfill the requirements of the question.

This Act was dismissed soon after the Parliament was prorogued.

This law was made unconstitutional in order to hold back the powers of Supreme — the autocratic pillar muddling around in state affairs.

### Conclusion :

Every tier has certain functions. There are thousands of cases pending in courts. The do judicial activism is good in some matters but and unchecked and unbridled activism caused much political vacuum in past by wrong decisions. Such interventions and marriage between these 3 pillars should end.

## Too specific details for an Intro

### Introduction:

Despite the enactment of 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment, ~~the~~ political devolution is not implemented in true sense. The long held elections of Karachi Mayor, the no election in Balochistan for local government KP elections were not transparent and Punjab still struggling. No Constitutional restriction over non compliance of holding local elections and no minimum time to hold elections is still questionable.

The political accountability is nowhere seen in case of provincial autonomy. The provinces are not crosschecked for resource allocation.

The local government can collect tax as in UK.

The long extended NFC award further add fuel to fire. The resources allocation is always

blamed and the population census is not being utilized properly.

### Questions of Political devolution.

Our government system has weak base.

The steel frame is swinging and is mostly **Structure as per what is being asked** but by foreign invasion and self interests. The local government structures are upheld in letters but not spirit.

Local government - not in spirit:

The Union councils, councillor elections and records of Tehsils and people in them are never collected efficiently.

The Nazim and Mayors never had power to regulate the bureaucracy and state institutions when they got power it

was just exercised as a tool from heads.

- (a) The Local government can't collect, allocate or utilize tax
- (b) They do not have writ or structure to hold accountable the institutes leaders
- (c) Due to migration and rapid changes in demography the union records are outdated and are never updated
- (d) There are no offices or infra structure to grace the people or attract good educated masses towards these seats
- (e) The masses are unaware of the advantages of strong local government.
- (f) The powers are never decentralized from provincial tier.
- (g) The autocratic and self-serving tendencies or elite power never wanted true representation of masses.
- (h) The lobbying in Karachi and no interest of government to hold free and fair elections of LC is bad.
- (i) The inter-relation and platform for these members are nowhere seen
- (j) The masses are not valuing the authority and importance of them due to poor will of state institutions.
- (k) The power held by seniors is not letting this pillar to get strong.
- (l) If they are elected, they do not get funds for development and lose the public trust for next elections

## You can't write in points Structure your answer

### Provincial autonomy:

The allocation of fund is done but the checking of expenditure for proper allocation within state is absent.

The educational budget is devolved but the infrastructure of it is absent.

The tax collection disparity and difference in population and respective allocation is not ended.

Self centered revenue department and wasteful practices of funds for personal gain is at rise.

Accountability boards of provinces are either absent or they lack the authorities.

The federal intervention and political black mailing and lobbying causes disparities in fund allocation of cities.

Spending on their favourite constituencies and less focus on less developed areas are problematic.

Talk about the significant points such as CCI conflict resolution etc

### Anti centre feelings:

The long held NFC award and now being extended since 2010 is worst tension.

The population change, the floods the rapid urbanization and water and energy shortfalls of provinces aggravate the situation.

The 5 indicators population, population increase, resources and area. Collection - all factors are never updated.

- Grievances of provinces in matter of governance, tax reforms and resource allocation arise
- The long held example of Kalabagh dam.
- The disputes on food between Punjab and KP.
- The water issues and Sindh problems are never addressed
- The centre not interested in south of Punjab and Interior Sindh.
- The vote bank attract development only.
- The national security plan - marred by terrorism.
- The NDMA ignoring the redevelopment.
- The Inflation due to bad interprovincial relations - Agri based Punjab and water based KP. Challenge each other for resources.
- The Political will to address is meager.

#### Way forward:

Expanding the base of democracy, the Local Government reforms and implementation in a letter and true spirit is need of an hour. Examples of India and UK must be followed. Similarly the new consensus must be effectively utilized and New NFC reward must be made keepy in view new indicators. Political will must ensure uniform and due share to all areas of Pakistan irrespective of their interest and vote bank.