

Question :

Write a comparative analysis on Aristotle and Plato's concept of ideal state.

Plato and Aristotle both are the greatest ancient greek philosophers. Both were concerned with the nature of state, justice and the best form of government. Plato in his Republic give the idea of state governed by the philosopher-king, but Aristotle, his pupil, gave the idea of state governed by many in which middle class is a stabilizer element. Both have the idea of state that should work in favour of common good. Plato's ideal state is generally based on utopian and impracticality but Aristotle's approach is realistic.

Similarities between Both
Plato's & Aristotle's ideal state

(a) Welfare of Community :

Both Plato and Aristotle believe that in their ideal state there will be the social welfare and government/ruler will make sure the common good or public interest.

(b) Justice as key :

Both argue that in the ideal state there will be the ultimate justice. Plato stated that :

"Justice is the integral part of soul."

Rulers should govern on the basis of justice.

(c) Importance of Education :

Both highlights the importance of education in their ideal states. Education give direction to the citizen in order to perform the roles.

(d) Reject of Tyranny :

Both philosophers reject the idea of Tyranny. Both argue that Tyranny is the worst form of government.

minimum description under a heading should be 5 lines.

e) State as Natural Institution :

Both believe that human is a social animal and not a self-sufficient. Both believe that state is a natural institution and basic social need of human beings.

Contradictions In their Concept of Ideal State

It is commonly said that :

"Aristotle is a great, but not a grateful student of Plato."

It is because Aristotle's views are different

from plato in many ways.

use elaborate and self explanatory headings.

(a) Concept of Justice :

Plato believe that justice means each social class work independently without interfering other. But on the other hand, Aristotle believe that justice is pay the due to everyone.

(b) Social Stratification :

Plato divides the society into 3 main classes but Aristotle deny the social class divisions in the society.

(c) Idealism Vs Realism :

Plato's Ideal state is merely depends on imagination and considered as ~~utopia~~ utopian and impractical while Aristotle's Ideal state ^{was} based on the idea of realism.

he studied more than 150 states so his ideal state was considered more practical.

(1) Aristocracy Vs Polity :

Plato's ideal state has few number of rules who rule on basis of wisdom and their spiritual element while for Aristotle the ideal state has many no of rules who governs for the common good and welfare of community.

(c) Gendered base Education :

Plato's ideal state must have a mandatory education for all including women but Aristotle focus was more on men education and he exclude the women from education.

(d) Conflict in Communism :

Plato's concept of common property and wives was rejected by Aristotle. Plato believe that property and family make the gaudin clan selfish while Aristotle believe that family brings purpose and make the rulers more responsible and honest.

(g) Population of state :

According to Plato, the best size of state is 5040 while Aristotle believe that the size of state may vary from 10k to 100k.

(h) Conflict in Rule of law :-

For Plato the Ruler is above law and laws are secondary in front of ruler's wisdom and capability while for Aristotle

the law above Rules. There must the Rule of law Ideal state of Aristotle.

(4) Citizen Participation :

Plato did not allow the participation of citizens in the governance. But for Aristotle the ~~middle~~ class is stabilized as it ~~avoid~~ the extremes and have check and provide stability in the society.

Final Remarks

Both agree at the few points such as justice, education and common good but their approach for designing Ideal state is quite different from each other. Moreover the Aristotle's Ideal state is considered as the more ~~practical~~ and scientific in today's world, Plato's Ideal state is not applicable in Real world.