

## Topic: English As The Medium of Education In Pakistan.

### Outline:

#### A. Introduction

- (i) Quote by Nelson Mandela
- (ii) Linkage of the quote to Education system in Pakistan
- (iii) Thesis statement

#### B. Retrospective Analysis of English Medium Education

- (i) Role of Sir Syed Ahmed Khan
- (ii) East India Company policies after 1857
- (iii) Colonial hangover in Present Day Pakistan

#### C. English Medium Education in Pakistan; Present Trends and Major Developments

- (i) Ratio of English as a mode of instruction in contemporary institutions
- (ii) National Education Policy 2009
- (iii) Developments in National Education Policy throughout 10 years

#### D. Impacts of English Medium Education on Socio-Cultural Norms.

- (i) Major impact on erosion of culture
  - Sidelining regional languages
  - **Rising trend for**
- (ii) Increasing trend towards English as a metric of social status

(2)

- ~~Creation of societal divisions~~ Deepening

### (iii) Accelerated growth of Private Institutions

- Sudden rise in market driven schooling

### (iv) Branding of education Institutes

- Increasing trend in a ~~prejudiced~~ job market

### E. Is English Medium Education a Path to Prosperity for India?

- Case studies of Scandinavian countries (Finland)
- Example of Chinese Education system

### F. Conclusion

- ~~The~~ healthy balance between English, Urdu and other regional languages in education institutes.

(3)

## Essay

~~"Education is the most powerful weapon which you can use to change the world."~~

This is an infamous quote about the importance of Education by Nelson Mandela. Statements and quotes by such personalities are quite inspiring but seldom do we realize the actual meaning and potential of these powerful words. Context, is really important in such cases where a country is; not only required to deliver in this arena but also devise policy which caters to all sections of a society, which is the case of Education in Pakistan, where English is

The national course of action in this regard has been chaotic, where some administrations have taken significant measures to address the situations, while others have

(4)

only clung to the past policies without catering to the demands of ~~the era~~ **Demands of the present era**

As a result of this havoc, there is not a comprehensive ~~course~~ **There is no** of action with regards to curriculum, medium of instruction and budget allocation. This has led to an unprecedented erosion of culture, problems in identity, privatisation of education, prejudiced job market and even widening social gap between the rich and the poor. A plethora of arguments suggest that English as a medium of education has helped in prosperity to some extent, but it has also caused a ~~number of~~ **Link from one paragraph to another one** which damage the socio-cultural fabric of the country.

To begin with, it is crucial to shed light on events of the past which have paved the way for the present education system in Pakistan. The role of ~~Sir Syed~~ **Avoid writing in such confusing expression** Ahmed Khan in this regard can not be

~~He was the most important~~ figure in the 19<sup>th</sup> century history of Muslims of subcontinent who made them realize the importance of education, especia-

(5)

ly western mode of education. He had the difficult task to make his sidelined and

distant from education Muslims realize that

the actual freedom will come only by adopting

to West. He made

them realize that the only way to change

a system was to become an integral part

of that system in the first place. He intro-

duced English literature in all subjects and

translated them into Urdu. Moreover, he

set up English medium institutes to better

integrate Muslims in the society and to

elevate their societal status. The most notable

of these institutes was the Mohammad Anglo-

Oriental college in Aligarh. This marked the

beginning of introduction of western education

in Muslim institutes and societies.

During his lifetime, the British East India

company introduced a variety of policies

in the subcontinent. The most prominent

of them was introduction of English language

in institutions from the very basic level.

But after the 1857 war of independence

Muslims were very ready to be

controlled by the companies so they kept

( 6 )

themselves away from Western - model of education which later proved to be disastrous for them. This is where the role of Sir Syed played in an advised Muslim to keep themselves aloof from politics and focus solely on education. English language at the time had become a precursor to British loyalty and guaranteed in respectable institutes like the civil service and other prestigious government jobs. So, upon Sir Syed's awakening, Muslims started to learn the language, adopted the Western education system and managed to score well reputed jobs not only in government institutes but also in politics. This greatly aided Muslims in their political advancements and later the independence struggle.

There is no doubt that all of this struggle and movement, specifically by Sir Syed Ahmed Khan and later other Muslim leaders proved to be beneficial to Muslim at the time, but it significantly impacted the development in educational institutions especially in Pakistan. The patterns of struggle and institutes had an enormous impact on policy formulation

(7)

and institutional setup in Pakistan. There is an evident colonial hangover in educational norms in the country across all sections of society. We are politically, economically and administratively not a part of British empire but somewhere along the cultural lines, we have not given up on British values in education.

The English language has become an integral part of our education whether as a medium of instruction, in casual conversations or in research at higher levels. There is a clear colonial hangover which does not seem to go away in the foreseeable future.

It was extremely important to shed light on previous events which led to the present-day education system in Pakistan.

~~in a logical~~ but it is equally

important to have a closer look at the

recent policy designs and major developments of the country on this road. So, let us have a closer look at present trends and developments of English Medium Education in Pakistan.

First and foremost, it is crucial to understand the important statistics which will help

(8)

to substantiate our arguments later. There is no doubt that English medium education is increasingly losing its importance in present day Pakistan. **Has become**

day Pakistan. But it is also important to note that public schools still comprise a major portion of schools in Pakistan, and the medium of instruction in those schools is either Urdu or other regional languages. However the situation in major cosmopolitan cities and developed provinces provide a different reality, where the private educational institutes, especially at school level outnumber the public ones. According to 2017 census of Punjab schools, there were 50 thousand public whereas 60 thousand private schools, which means that there is an increasing trend towards privatisation of education and English as a medium of instruction in these institutions. Such statistical analysis is crucial to understand the disparities in education system of Pakistan.

Drawing on statistical data, the policymakers lay out the frameworks and drafts in any administration. The education policy is no different, there have been numerous attempts throughout Pakistan's history where there were active efforts

(9)

to devise a comprehensive policy framework for the country. This included budgetary provisions like those in Pervez Musharraf's era where education spending was 15% of government spending but it was not until 2009, when government of Pakistan was finally able to devise an education policy. Within this policy, an important decision was made with regard to English as a medium of instruction in educational institutions especially the higher education. But unfortunately there were no provisions of sustainable educational priorities or a focus on balancing the public private institutional ratio, which has exacerbated in the present time and is leaving long lasting imprints on society.

Additionally, there have been some noteworthy advancements in educational policy formulation throughout the year. After the 2009 policy framework, a draft of National Education Policy by the ministry of federal education was proposed in 2015 but it could not be translated into a comprehensive policy. Concentrated efforts were made during the tenure of PM Imran Khan where there were notable efforts to frame a new

(10)

policy in 2018 but it failed due to political unrest in the country before its final drafting in 2021. At present, Pakistan has not been able to ~~Good u have well connected idea~~ formulate a new policy framework which inculcates global standards, modern practices in education and which caters to national needs. This depicts a grim picture of educational institution and policy making bodies in the country.

The Musharraf era educational policies were mostly influenced by our important role in US war on terror. English was promoted to "modernize" Pakistan's image in front of the world after the deteriorating image projection of Muslims and Pakistan in the international media. The alliance of US pressure at the time and Pakistan's own insecurities led to the so called modernization of the education system.

A retrospective analysis on educational fiasco of the subcontinent and the subsequent effects on present day Pakistan tell us that English medium education was a combination of different movements, policy frameworks and alliance premises which shaped the country's

(11)

education system to a large extent. Now, it is important to shed light on the effects of this English medium education on Pakistan's economy and culture at large.

Firstly, this English mode of education has left remarkable impacts on Pakistani culture. There is an increasing trend of English language as a medium of instruction especially in the private schools. People have become increasingly comfortable with English language, especially parents who want their kids to be fluent in the language from the very beginning.

According to Gallup Pakistan, 58% Pakistanis opine that the medium of instruction for higher education in Pakistan should be English. This is equally due to primary and secondary schooling in private institutions. This has lasting impacts on regional languages which are increasingly becoming sidelined. There are more than seventy regional languages spoken throughout Pakistan but due to overwhelming English demand in private schools children are more prone to not be fluent in their other tongue and other regional languages. This has

(12)

led to an erosion of cultural heritage. If this trend persists in the present pace, it is only a matter of time that, if this continues, these regional languages will be completely sidelined. Hence, English as a medium of instruction has become an indirect threat to regional languages in Pakistan.

This trend does not only remain with educational institutions, rather it has a tendency to create social hierarchies especially in developing countries like Pakistan. According to numerous studies and surveys, private schools include only people from upper-middle and elite classes while some schools include people from lower-middle and poor classes.

The underlying cause is the economic means but English language also plays an important role here. Children from private schools are the Beaconhouse Franchise are considered smart and confident primarily due to their fluency in English language. While on the other hand, children from government schools are known to be underconfident and less fluent in their mother tongue in a foreign language. This exacerbates the already wide class

(B)

gap in Pakistani society. These arguments are a fool proof ~~that~~ English is a medium of education in Pakistan is increasingly becoming a metric of social status.

Furthermore, private institutions are in high demand in Pakistan, as they are considered a metric of elevated social status and provide ample growth opportunities to students in their formative years. This has led to a sudden rise in private institutions in Pakistan: ~~the last 10 years~~

to relatively progressive provinces like Punjab but is also seen the rise in less progressive provinces like Khyber Pakhtunkwa. According to BISE Abbottabad there are approximately 2000 private institutions in Abbottabad alone which has a small population of 1.3 million people. Reportedly, parents of these children have confidence in educational policies and curriculum of private institutes.

On one hand while it ensures healthy competition between private sector it increasingly marginalises the govt and public schools and ultimately the quality of education in these areas.

Hence, a sudden rise in private institutions has led to market driven shooting in Pakistan.

(14)

In addition to this, accelerated private school growth and related English medium education system has led to commercialization of education. Education institutes all over Pakistan have become a brand. This is relatively a novel phenomenon in the country, but is growing at an unprecedented pace. This trend of branding is not only limited to schools but has also engulfed higher educational institutes. Private universities like LUMS, IBA, BNU are not just institutes but brands which guarantee a ~~stable job~~. ~~These are~~ branded such because of their Western mode of education with English as the primary medium of instruction. The major chunk of population in these institutes belong to the top 20 percent richest strata of Pakistan, which reiterates the argument that Western and English medium institutes are 'branded' as elite and more progressive.

Coupled with this trend is another trend which is the ~~prejudice~~ job market. As stated above these Western-mode branded institutions charge so high because they guarantee job security. Recruiters from industries of all

(15)

kind and other multi-national corporations demand degrees from such institutions. Sometimes a mere degree, without any relevant experience is sufficient to hire such individuals. Whereas people from public universities with far better degrees and diplomas in addition to relevant experience remain unemployed. Majority of these people, if they find a job, are persuaded to do unremunerated work. In short they are over-qualified and underpaid whereas as people from branded institutes are underqualified and overpaid.

The underlying reason for this is the very English medium standards which is directly responsible for the skewed job market.

All of these arguments substantiate the claim that English as a medium of instruction in Pakistan has created widespread class difference in almost every aspect of life.

But is this the only problem? Whether

this guarantees progress or prosperity for a country like Pakistan or not.

There is no doubt about the fact that English language is increasingly becoming global and is vital to navigate an increasingly globalised and interlinked world.

(16)

It is equally encouraging the countries like Pakistan are navigating this change in world with emphasis to learn this language at all segments of society. On the contrary, it is also important to give due importance to regional and national language Urdu. Pakistan has to give up the ideology that English medium education is the best. It is a property. More emphasis on English medium education means more progressive and civil population. The reality is far from it. It tells a whole another tale. If this ideology were true, then so many children in Pakistan would not be out of school.

There would not be rising premium all over the country given the number of private schools and there would definitely be easy and better access to education for all.

The argument deepens with taking into account some case studies of progressive countries where there is more emphasis on quality of education rather than mode of instruction. Developed countries in Nordic region, like Finland, have a widespread policy of providing elementary education

(17)

strictly in their national language, Finnish.

There is widespread understanding of this language in general population. The introduction of other languages is not outrightly avoided but rather introduced at secondary levels as a foreign language. This allows for healthy competition for both languages to grow and also for a society based on strong ethnic identity.

Similarly in China, the medium of instruction across China is Standard Mandarin Chinese. All state schools and most private schools teach in Chinese based on the Beijing dialect.

Both of these countries have highly progressive education systems and are of the best in the world. On the contrary there is no such policy for integrating regional and national languages into curriculum. Rather these languages are associated with backwardness and low social status. According to a

survey of Gallup Pakistan, 1 in 5 Pakistanis opine that society does not give enough respect to government school teachers. These statistics provide a grim picture for Pakistan's public education sector. Pakistan

(18)

can learn from examples of China and Finland and build a framework parallel to their while keeping their unique societal, economical and cultural practices in check. Such comprehensive policies can help reduce the societal gap and provide better access to quality education for all segments of society.

Similarly, there is a variety of different arguments that English as a medium of instruction may aid Pakistan to prosper in a more globalized world but in the bigger picture it is equally important to take regional languages and Urdu into consideration, as English as a primary and most widespread medium of instruction in educational institutions has led to a variety of socio-cultural problems. Most notable of these problems are sidelining of regional languages, erosion of national culture, increasing trend of private education leading to a widening societal gap between the rich and the poor. Moreover, it has led to branding of institutions where public institutes are

(19)

considered to be low quality. Parents are also more likely to tilt towards these brainwashed institutions furthering the social gap.

Increased trend of private, western mode institutes also leads to a more prejudiced job market. Pakistan needs to develop a comprehensive policy framework to inculcate Urdu and other regional languages into the system and devise methods to detach the shame associated with Urdu medium institution. As this shame not only creates class divisions but also has negative implications on cultural identity and nationalism. There is an urgent need for a robust policy which will <sup>catapult</sup> take Pakistan from list of underdeveloped into developing countries.