

Date: _____

cl)

Day: _____

Benevolent Dictatorship
is preferable to a
Corrupt Democracy

Essay Outlines

1) Introduction:

Thesis Statement:

"The benevolent dictatorship is not preferable to a corrupt democracy due to absence of public legitimacy and right to dissent. However, some people believe that a benevolent dictatorship is more preferable because of effective decision making and devolution of power to grass root level."

2) Decode the term "Dictatorship" and "Democracy"

3) Why benevolent dictatorship is not preferable to a corrupt democracy?

i) Public legitimacy is
not provided to

Date:

2

Day:

dictatorship unlike
democracy

Date:

vii,

(ii) Dictatorship is
the rule of elite class
unlike democracy

(iii) Constitutional violations
in dictatorship due
to absence of check
and balance unlike
democracy

viii,

(iv) Right to speech
and public dissent
are stifled in
dictatorship

(ix)

(v) Public opinion is
molded as information
comes from centralized
authority

1) Wh
is
de

(vi) Militarism and
foreign military
adventures are more
common in dictatorship

(vii), Military expenditure takes a huge part of budget than human development in dictatorship

(viii), Economic growth is hampered due to flawed policies in dictatorship

(ix), Dictatorship remains for indefinite period of time unlike democracy.

4) Why benevolent dictatorship is preferable to corrupt democracy?

(i) Effective ^{decision} making in dictatorship compared to a corrupt democracy

(ii) Devolution of power to local bodies in a benevolent dictatorship compared to a corrupt democracy

4

Date:

Date:

5- Conclusion

Date:

ESSAY

"Dictatorship is the authoritarian form of government which controls all parts of life including social, political and economic." [Mazhar ul Haq].

Dictatorship is adverse to freedom, so it controls the life of people in all possible ways. Even benevolent dictatorship is not preferable to a corrupt democracy.

Firstly, dictatorship does not enjoy public legitimacy and seizes power usually by force. In addition, there are constitutional violations in dictatorship due to absence of check and balance. Furthermore, people's right to freedom of speech and political dissent is stifled. Moreover, military expenditures take a lion's share in the budget compared to spending on human development. However,

some people believe that a benevolent dictatorship is more preferable to a corrupt democracy. There is effective decision making in a benevolent dictatorship compared to a corrupt democracy. Besides, there is devolution of power to grass root level for effective governance in a benevolent dictatorship. While power is more centralized in a corrupt democracy which leads to bad governance. Thus, the benevolent dictatorship is ~~more~~ less preferable to a corrupt democracy due to absence of public legitimacy and right to dissent. However, some people believe that a benevolent dictatorship is more preferable because of effective decision making and devolution of power to grass root level.

The term "dictatorship" means

Date:

7

Day:

a one man rule in which a person takes power by force and demands unwavering obedience from his nation. On the other hand, the term "democracy" means rule of people by the people and for the people.

Benevolent dictatorship is not preferable to a corrupt democracy because unlike democracy, public legitimacy is not provided to a dictatorship rule.

In a dictatorship, a dictator uses the pretext of political and economic crises as a pretext to seize power. In history, many dictators have used these reasons to rule nations. For instance, Mussolini in Italy and Hitler in Germany used political and economic crises as a reason to overthrow democratic governments in Europe. In Pakistan,

Zia-ul-Haq used political crisis to overthrow the democratic government of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto and ruled Pakistan for 10 years. Hence, public legitimacy is absent in dictatorship unlike democracy.

Dictatorship is the rule of elite class unlike democracy. In dictatorship, the dictators belong to a particular class of people. Most of the people in a country are sidelined as the dictator protects the interests of a narrow elite. In a book, Political Science: Theory and Practice, the author stated, "Dictatorship is the rule of elite class and it does not work for the interest of whole nation". Hence, in dictatorship the elite class rule the people unlike democracy where any person can form government with people's mandate.

There are constitutional violations in dictatorship due to absence of check and balance. It is because a dictator is not answerable to anyone and he takes decisions upon his whims. Dictators also abrogate constitutions of a countries and halt fundamental rights. For example, Yahya Khan abrogated 1962 constitution and Musharraf²¹⁹ put 1973 constitution in abeyance. Thus, dictatorship is ridden with constitutional violations unlike democracy where rulers follow constitutions.

Right of speech and public dissent are stifled in dictatorship. In dictatorship, people are not provided with the freedom of speech. Moreover, they are not allowed to ^{show} dissent ~~from~~ to the policies of a dictator. For instance,

a conservative writer wrote,
"In dictatorship, we do not believe in giving such fundamental right which put people above the state and they work in opposition to the state". Thus, fundamental rights like freedom of speech and right to dissent are not to people under dictatorship rule.

Public opinion is molded as information comes from centralized authority. Unlike democracy, there is no free flow of information in dictatorship. As a result, public opinion depicts the will of a dictator. For example, Yuval Noah Harari wrote in his book "Nexus" that information is a new gold in today's world. However, information is much restricted in dictatorship and flow from top to

Date:

11

Day:

bottom with several changes which shape their public opinion. Thus, public opinion is dictated in dictatorship unlike democracy where it is educated.

Militarism and foreign military adventures are more common in dictatorship compared to democracy. Dictators use ^{person} military adventures to prolong their stay in power and regain the lost glory of their nations. For example, Mussolini attacked Ethiopia and Hitler attacked Poland to regain the lost glory. Moreover, Kargil War between India and Pakistan during Musharraf rule in Pakistan. Thus, militarism and foreign wars are the hallmarks of a dictatorship.

Military expenditure takes huge part of budget than human development in

dictatorship. The military dictators unabatedly allocate huge budget to military expenditure to prepare for wars with enemy states.

As a result, human development indicators of a state deteriorate.

To illustrate, Ayub Khan allocated a huge part of budget to military expenditures. Moreover, Stalin also provided a lion's share of budget to military rather than spending it on human development of his nation.

Hence, more money is used for military expenditures than human development in dictatorship.

Economic growth is hampered due to flawed policies of a dictator in dictatorship. Dictators are not adept in the art

of running the state machinery. As a result, their policies lead to economic crunch.

and add to the miseries of people. To illustrate, the Howard Trickle Down model of Ayub Khan led to the concentration of wealth in 22 families rather than improving the lives of common people. [The Problems in Pakistan Economy book]. Moreover, the collectivization of Agriculture land, by Lenin, led to less Agriculture growth and famine in Ukraine region of USSR. Thus, the flawed policies of dictators led to economic crunch.

Dictatorship remains for indefinite period of time unlike democratic government in democracy. As dictators are not bound to a certain period of time for their stay in power. They extend their rule to a large period of time. For example

Ayub Khan ruled Pakistan from 1958 to 1969. Similarly, Zia-ul-Haq ruled the country from 1979 to 1988. Thus, dictators remain in power for indefinite period of time.

The aforementioned paragraphs explained the reasons why ^{even} benevolent dictatorship is not preferable to a corrupt democracy. The following paragraphs will explain its (Antithesis) or contrary.

Some people believe that a benevolent dictatorship is more preferable to a corrupt democracy because there is effective decision making in a dictatorship. In a dictatorship, there is a centralized process of decision making compared to a democracy where consensus of all stakeholders is required for a policy.

For instance, "Political Science: Theory and Practice" the author explained that a democracy is always two years behind a dictatorship due to lack of timely decision making. Thus, effective decision making is a reason why a ^{benvolent} dictatorship is more preferable to a corrupt democracy. There is

Devolution of power is a benvolent dictatorship compared to centralization of power is a corrupt democracy. The dictators devolve power to grass root level for effective governance where as democratic government tries to hold on to ^{more} power.

For instance, China has delegated certain power like sanitation and tax collection to local bodies for effective governance. However, in Pak, despite Article 40A of the constitution of 1973

which stress on the devolution of power to local bodies, local bodies remain ineffective in their functioning. Hence, devolution of power can be found in Dictatorships unlike democracy.

In a nutshell, the benevolent dictatorship is not preferable to a corrupt democracy due to absence of public legitimacy. In addition, fundamental rights are stifled in dictatorships. Moreover, a large part of budget is specified for military rather than human development like education and health in a dictatorship. However, few people believe that a benevolent dictatorship is preferable due to effective decision making and devolution of power for effective governance.

Date: _____

17

Day: _____

Despite all arguments, democracy is more preferable, even if corrupt, in the modern world to fulfill the aspirations of people and provide them with fundamental rights. Dictatorship is a one man rule while democracy is a form of government in which people are involved in decision making.
