

Day: _____

M. Shafiqat Ali

Date: _____

34611 M. Shafiqat -065

Q No.1 In light of Pakistan's current political instability, could a Presidential system be a solution to governance issues?
 Critically evaluate

Ans-

Since its inception Pakistan is facing political instability due to multiple factors which have created a lot of hurdles in governance system. Which system will best suit for Pakistan, this debate often resurrects in political discourse of Pakistan. Those who are in favor of Presidential system, present their point that as parliamentary system has failed to deliver in Pakistan so we must adopt the Presidential system for the betterment of the Pakistan. Opponents rebut this point by presenting their view, it is the only parliamentary system which can deliver in Pakistan.

②

Day: _____

Date: _____

Previous attempts toward adoption of the Presidential System.

1956 Gen. Ayub Khan formed a commission whose sole responsibility was to critically analyze the parliamentary system and to figure out why it is not best option for

Pakistan. In 1958 Ayub Khan became the President of Pakistan and in 1962 he introduced the presidential system in Pakistan.

Due to this a huge governance gap was observed in East-Pakistan, it was also one of the problems which caused division of Pakistan into two separate independent countries.

In 1972 Zulfikar Ali Bhutto also attempted to implement the Presidential System in Pakistan due to this he had to face strong opposition from not only his own opposition side but also

from his own party. Then Zulfikar Ali Bhutto was compelled to continue with the parliamentary system.

Stability in governance policies

In parliamentary system the head of the government can easily be removed from his office by initiating a vote of no-confidence resolution against him. In Pakistan this can be done under article 95 of the Pakistan Constitution and vote of no confidence require a simple majority from the lower house from where the head of government is elected.

As head of government has no fixed tenure and can be sent to home easily same will be done for his policies.

A new government in many cases stop working on

5

Day: _____

Date: _____

the initiatives and policies and introduce their own policies which creates hurdles in governance.

But in Presidential system the President is the head of the state and as well as the head of the government. In Presidential system the president has generally a fixed tenure. To remove a president from his office is not an easy task.

For example in USA if congress want to remove the President they will start a process of impeachment.

Only Congress the lower house of the assembly has ~~set~~ power to initiate a process of impeachment and introduce the articles of charge against President.

Congress has to pass this resolution by simple majority.

(5)

Day: _____

Date: _____

Then senate will become the court to proceed this impeachment process. To remove a president, the chief justice will preside the session. A committee of senate members called "Managers" start prosecution. Then senate head need two third majority to finalize the impeachment.

So the president can take long term decisions if he is visionary.

Parochial Vs National Politics.

In parliamentary system the Head of Government is elected by legislators. Each legislator is elected from his local constituency. PM has fear of vote of no confidence and legislator will influence him for his locality, which will restrict the head of government to take short term decisions.

6

Day: _____

Date: _____

But in Presidential system the president has the direct mandate and whole state becomes the single constituency and he takes decisions at broader level for the betterment of his public.

Under influence of electables.

In Pakistan's politics the electables play a vital role. Each party wants to have them in their party. And then these electables exert under influence on head of the government while taking decisions.

But in presidential system there is no such influence.

Separation of Powers.

In parliamentary system, parliament, executive and judiciary are interdependent.

But in presidential system the parliament, executive and judiciary are independent in their functions.

The legislature make laws.

President directly heads the executive and select his cabinet according to his choice. And executive is not responsible to the congress.

Wide range to select cabinet for governance in Presidential system.

In parliamentary system the cabinet is only drawn from legislation. According to the article 92 of Constitution of Pakistan the Federal or State minister must be a elected person. So the head of the government has limited choice to select the appropriate person for the specific ministry.

We have often seen in Pakistan the appointed Federal ministers have no or little

Knowledge about his entrusted portfolio.

But in Presidential system the president is not bound to draw his cabinet from only legislators. He can choose any expert from specific walk of life for specific ministry. When an expert govern a specific department then productivity is increased which lead to better governance.

Old MultiParty System and current new Dynamics of Pakistan.

most of the developed countries in the world have two political parties in their country except china which has only one party. If we see previous history of Pakistan we have multiparty system which shows we have no political union according to each party manifesto. We have seen only two times ~~a~~ where ~~party~~ a single party won the elections

with two third majority first in 1997 and second in 2018.

But due to social awareness we see majority of the public now take interest in politics of Pakistan which can lead toward less parties in Pakistan and strong consensus according to manifestos of parties.

Conclusion.

Previous discussion shows that if we become able to elect a visionary leader for the post of president by implementing the Presidential system, By taking long term and national level decision he can ensure better governance in Pakistan until he becomes an autocrat.

Wide range of choice to draw the cabinet provides an opportunity to each department to have an expert as its chairperson, until

10

Day: _____

Date: _____

the nepotism. The biggest issue that we have from presidential system is that he will be selected every time from Punjab. Because Punjab has almost 50% of Pakistan's population. And if president started behaving like an autocrat it will lead toward huge disasters like 1971. This issue can be addressed by making new provinces.