

Q No  
1  
2022  
CIS

Critically evaluate Aristotle  
classification of State and  
Government

No need for this detailed  
outline for a 20 marks  
answer

Outlines Introduction

② ~~Explanation~~

- (a) Principles of Classification
- (b) Forms of Government

③ ~~Defects in Classification~~

- ① Confuse State with Government
- (b) Not valid for modern States
- (c) Dr Leacock and Seely opinions
  - (i) not explaining difference between Constitutional monarchy and monarchy
  - (ii) fails to explain difference between Constitutional monarchy and democracy e.g UK
  - (iii) cannot explain presidential and parliamentary form of Government
  - (iv) cannot differentiate between Unitary and Federal form of Gov

④ Conclusion

(1)

## Introduction

Aristotal classification of State and Government is the first systematic but not scientific classification. It is different from J.A.R Marriott and Dr. Leacock classification because their classification are more comprehensive in nature.

Aristotle classify State and Government on the basis of number of people and how they exercise the supreme power of the state. It was criticize by many philosopher such as Dr. Leacock, Seely and Garner. Aristotle didnot give a comprehensive overview on state, such as to explain difference between Despotism and monarchy, democracy and Constitutional democracy, presidential and parliamentary, and federal and unitary form of government.

Moreover, Aristotle's Classification is suitable for Greek City-states not for modern States.

## (2) Explanation:

The Aristotelian Classification is based on two principles. The one form change into another when king use/exercised for self interest. So people starts uprising and topple the government and then establish new form of government which are given in detail.

### (a) Principles of Classification

⇒ The number of Peoples exercising supreme power in the state

⇒ The Supreme leaders or king exercise power for the welfare of state or for self interest.

### (b) Forms of Government (Aristotelian)

Classification Graph: ~~dis~~ given below

Discuss this part in more detail

Day: \_\_\_\_\_

(4)

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

**Monarchy**

When a single person exercise Supreme power

for the welfare of state and individual

**Tyranny**

When a king exercise Supreme power

to protect his own interest

**Aristocracy**

When few person exercise Supreme power

for the welfare of state and individual

**Oligarchy**

The perverted form of Aristocracy

**Polity**

When many people exercise Supreme power

for the welfare of state and individual

**Democracy**

The perverted form of Polity

Discuss the

Aristotelian cycle as

well

⑤

DEFECTS

(a) Confuses State with Government

Aristotelian classification confuses

the concept of State with

Government. it cannot differentiate

between State and Government

(b) Not valid/Suitable for Modern State

It is only for Greek City-state

(5)

not valid for modern State because the domains and objectives of modern State are different from Greek City States.

### (E) Dr Leacock and Seely opinions on Aristotle classification.

Dr. Leacock and Seely criticize Aristotelian classification in terms of modern forms of government such as, monarchy, constitutional monarchy, democracy and unitary and federal form of government.

(a) fails in differentiating between monarchy and constitutional monarchy. Aristotelian classification of state and government fails to explain constitutional monarchy and monarchy.

(b) fails to explain constitutional monarchy and democracy. Aristotelian classification cannot explain constitution and democracy. difference. E.g. UK has constitutional monarchy but called a democracy.

(c) fails to explain Parliamentary

Add and highlight references/examples against these arguments

and presidential form of government

The classification cannot give idea or explain the concept of parliamentary and presidential form of government.

(d) Cannot explain Unitary and federal form of gov  
it cannot explain The unitary and federal form of government.

#### (4) Conclusion

In a nutshell, Aristotelian Classification is valid for and old Greek City state but not suitable for modern states. Because the interest and objectives, problems and solution are quite different from old states. It's also merely to explain the Constitution of state.