

Q. Examine the evolving dynamics of civil-military relations in Pakistan. How have these dynamics influenced Pakistan's foreign policy and national security?

I. Introduction

'The civil-military relations are a function of the strength of democratic institutions, the external threats and the internal security environment.'

—Raashid Wali Jangha.

The civil-military relations in Pakistan have gone through various phases till present. Since decolonization and then independence, there have been periods of estrangement, takeover and cooperation. At times it was the ambitions of few personalities while at other times there was a power vacuum due to weak democratic institutions. Moreover, these relations have impacted Pakistan's foreign policy particularly with India, Afghanistan, United States and China. Additionally, the influence on national security is manifested through counter-terrorism, nuclearization and ensuring economic security. With certain

Limitations, the civil-military relations in Pakistan are on an upward trajectory with several improvements required.

II. Civil-Military Relations in the Constitution of Pakistan

The civil-military relations have been clearly defined in the constitution of Pakistan

A. The Command of the Armed Forces is with the Federal Government

As a mix of the Concordance Theory by Rebecca Schiff and Principal-Agent Theory by Peter Feaver, Article 243 of the constitution of Pakistan gives the federal government command and control of the armed force. The president as the ^{supreme} commander appoints all four military chiefs on the advice of Prime Minister and can raise and maintain forces.

Use elaborate and relevant headings

B. The Functions of the Armed Forces

Article 245 defines the functions, major being to defend the state against external aggression and act in aid

of civil power when called upon to do so.

III. Evolution of Civil Military Relations in Pakistan

The civilians and the military have had a changing relationship throughout their history.

A. The British Colonial Legacy

In the British colonial system the commander-in-chief was so powerful - only second to the viceroy - that he had declared

participation in WWII without the clearance of the government. Thus, Tan Tai Yang writes,

"The reliance on army, bureaucracy and feudal landlords was a centre-piece of the

colonial governance, which was replicated in the new Pakistani governance structure."

Ayesha Jalal writes that India changed this thinking, Pakistan did not.

B. Confrontation with External Pressure Right From Independence

Before Pakistan could begin to deal with internal challenges, the 1947-48 War

on Kashmir put Pakistan in a military-dominated situation. It had gotten to a point where a contempt of civilian decision-making began to emerge.

C. Dismissal of the Constituent Assembly and its endorsement by the Judiciary

In 1954, when Governor General Ghulam Muhammad dissolved the constituent Assembly, it was the first attack on the democracy of Pakistan. Later when the judiciary endorsed his decision, civilian supremacy was further compromised. Same year, the Governor General appointed Ayub Khan as the Minister of Defense, marking the beginning of armed men in civilian posts.

D. Political Stability But Military Stronghold

Then came the time when the change of chief executive was faster than changing dresses. Hasan Askar Rizvi in 'Military, State and Society' writes,

"Pakistan had seven prime Ministers

and eight cabinets between 1947 and 1958, whereas only one Commander-in-Chief."

E. Separation of East Pakistan and Political Preoccupations

The Dhaka debacle was a major blow to the state's national integrity. Attempts were made by Zulfikar Ali Bhutto for institutionalization of national security and decision-making through Defence committee of Cabinet. All the efforts went in vain with the Operation Fair Play of 1977.

F. More Military Interventions with punctuated Weak Democratic Interregnums

The military intervention continued intermittently till 2008. The major reason was weak civilian institutions. As S Akbar Zaidi in 'Military, Society and Democratization in Pakistan' writes,

"Weak civilian institutions and poor governance act as a magnet that invites non-democratic interventions."

G. The current Civil-military Liason

The ongoing civilian system which has thrived for sixteen years without intervention indicates a change in civil-military relations favoring democratic continuity as a national interest.

IV. Influence of the Civil-military Relations on Pakistan's Foreign Policy

The foreign policy of Pakistan has been impacted by the interaction of the civilian and military institutions.

A. Pakistan's Security-Driven Foreign Policy Towards India

Beginning with the Kashmir War, then the 1965 face-off, involvement of India in 1971 secession, then the 2019 Balakot incident has pressurized the government to bring the military in foreign policy. Moreover, the 1998 nuclearization of South Asia gave the military, as Samuel Huntington proposed, the objective control in dealing with India.

B. Pak-Afghan Relations In Face of Terrorism

Firstly, the Russian invasion and the the War on Terror, both began during military regimes. Then, such interventions in Afghanistan gave rise to revolt and terrorism. Pakistan as a direct and ethnically-connected neighbor bore the major brunt of terrorism. Both direct military support for national security was, and still remains - the demand of the hour.

C. Pakistan's Relation with United States: With Her or Without Her?

Pakistan had a hyphenated foreign policy with US in 1960s and 1970s. Then following 9/11, it changed to dehyphenated with United States requiring Strategic Partnership Agreement. Today, due to a strong India-US nexus, Pakistan has adopted a less military-dominated relation with United States.

Add and highlight references/examples against these arguments

Influence of the CMRs on National Security

A. The civil military correspondence in Counter-Terrorism

The military-led counterterrorism agency has necessitated the role of military to be in frontline.

B. Pakistan's Nuclear policy and the Military

Pakistan's nuclear security and nuclear doctrine ^{has brought civil and military} are in a collaboration under National Command Authority (NCA).

C. The Need for Economic Security

Pakistan's economic projects like CPEC are under constant threat especially the attacks of Chinese nationals as manifested in 2022 and 2024 Karachi attacks. This requires military cooperation.

VI. Conclusion

In conclusion, the civil-military relations in Pakistan have had a chequered history with one dominating or collaborating at different instances. However, the foreign policy and national security although impacted on their own, required a civil-military concordance for peaceful national and international working.