

Date: _____

Creating more provinces: Prospects, Challenges and Solutions.

Outline

(I) Introduction

Thesis statement

Creating more provinces is a debatable topic. It has positive and negative effects on the country's health and national integration. However, creating more provinces is conspicuously a sign of development and good governance in the country.

(II) Bird eye view on creating more provinces

(III) Demands of the provinces

- (a) South Punjab (Sardar)
- (b) Sindh new province (Mahajir)
- (c) KP new province (Itazara)
- (d) Balochistan new province (Baloch)

(IV) Prospects to the demands of new provinces.

- (a) Equal distribution of budget.

Date: _____

- (b) Equal share of NRC
- (c) Development in remote areas
- (d) Effective administration system
- (e) Redressal of grievances of people
- (f) Deal with ethnic problems
- (g) Opportunity for poor people
- (v) Solutions to the problems.
- (a) Provinces should be created not on ethnic basis
- (b) Provinces must not be created on political, but administrative basis
- (c) Provinces must be created on backwardness, not population.
- (d) ~~Provinces should be created~~
Share of NRC award must be ensured
- (e) Local government must be empowered
- (f) Provinces must be empowered

(3)

Date: _____

In Pakistan, the debate over the creating new provinces after the 18th amendment to the constitution has compelled the policy makers and the government to create new provinces to solve the issues of administration, economy, political, social and religious. Pakistan is no exception in this regard. The country has a structure of federal government in which there is a central government and provinces. Pakistan is home to four major provinces, one autonomous body Azad Jammu and Kashmir and another autonomous body of Gilgit Baltistan which is not yet the full province. In the world, creating more provinces has positive and negative effects on the state health. It has also multiple prospects and challenge on the states health. Positive effects of

Date: _____

creating more provinces: they will bring the development to the country. Sources will be equally distributed like NIC award. ~~It~~ They may bring the effective administration system in the country. They will address the ~~gover~~ grievances of the people and ensure equal opportunities to the poor people. More provinces also deal with the ethnic issues faced by the country. However, creating of more provinces has negative side. It can lead the country to the ethnic issues and threat to the national integration. It may affects the administration system, economy and development of the country. Ethnic-groups can create hurdles in the way of development, good governance and economy of the country.

Date: _____

In the world, we see many ~~states~~ countries with more provinces. For instance, USA with 50 states, India 28 plus seven union territories, Turkey 81 and China 34 states. These countries doing well economically and politically in the world with more provinces. As it divided the power into states and local governments. Probably the policy makers view, by doing so Pakistan substantially may better perform better economically and politically as predicted by the policy makers. At the time of establishment of the country was made one unit to avoid the cost of the measures. But India started the same process from beginning. India is those times at the country with 28 provinces and seven union territories. That country is performing well by more

(6)

Date: _____

provinces. For readjustment of the boundaries of the provinces, Article 90 of the Government of India Act ~~was~~ ~~1930~~ 1935 was kept elastic. After the independence India classified the constituent units into four categories. In 1953, it entrusted the task of reorganization of the provinces to the Fazal AL commission. The same recommended to have the state into 14 units and 3 union territories in 1955. This led to further reorganization of the state in 1956. To evaluate the readjustment of the state on ethnic and linguistic basis. In this regard, a Linguistic ~~const~~ Provincial Commission was formed to create more provinces on ethnic and linguistic basis. It rejected the same proposal on the basis of it. Again the task of ~~of~~ readjustment of provinces given to the Linguistic Provincial

Date: _____

Commission, again it rejected the proposal and instead, advised on administrative basis sustainable political and development. This shows that the creation of new provinces should be on the basis of administrative, political and development grounds. In the case of Pakistan, the country was came into being on the basis of ethnic ground, and the primary reason of the secession of the eastern wing was ethnicity. To readjustment at the provinces, Article 239 (4) of the constitution was inserted. To reduce the administrative costs and provincial prejudices "one unit policy" was introduced by General Ayub Khan. Following the merger of Fata with, the demand for creation of Hazara province came to fore. In Punjab the demand for creation of Sarawki province emerged.

the upgradation

Date: _____

The demand of more provinces first comes from the Seraiki belt after the 18th amendment. The merger of FATA with KP has intensified this demand in the four provinces. The demand of Seraiki province because they recognize themselves as distinguish. The demand of the creation of new provinces is not an unconstitutional move but this demand of the people at southern part is merely on ethnic and linguistic bases. Backwardness and low development is justified to demand for the new province as Seraiki. They face many difficulties to approach the provincial capital Lahore for some task. Further the Seraiki belt is lack of development in Punjab. Moreover 50 percent of the jobs are for the upgradation

Date: _____

(9)

goes to the upper and central Punjab. Many posts took the candidates from central Punjab as candidates from South Punjab could not compete in the test for job because of education and development in South Punjab. In the above circumstances, they started demanding for Sarda province. Further, the areas of South Punjab are marginalised in terms of resources like NIC award.

Similarly, the demand for new province from Muhajir community in Karachi as they distinguish themselves from the rest of the city. The city is the provincial capital of the Sindh province. The city is known to be the economic engine and economic hub of the country. Demanding the creation of new provinces for the upgradation

Date: _____

of that city on ethnic basis and linguistic would give rise further ethnicity in the city.

Other communities would start demanding the new provinces on ethnic and linguistic basis.

The demand of the Mahajir community for ^{new} province is only on ethnic and linguistic basis. So, it would further give rise ethnicity in other communities.

Likewise, the demand for new provinces came to fore following the 18th amendment merger of FATA with KP has enhanced the

area of the province. It gave birth to the demands ~~of~~ for creation of new province of Hazara. They also recognize ~~recognize~~ recognize Thouseb as distinguish community in the KP province.

The demand of the Hazara community for new province is completely on ethnic basis.

Date: _____

Mahajir community. It would also give rise more ethnicity in that province and the country. Last but not least, the demand of new province, as Pashtun province, in Balochistan. Balochistan has the largest area in the country. Most of the population is Baloch, and in northern part of the province lives Pashtun and demanding for their separate province. The demand for creation of Pashtun province in Balochistan completely on the grounds of the ethnic and linguistic.

There are multiple prospects and challenges to the creation of new provinces. Following are the prospect to the creation of new provinces. Including equal distribution of resources, share of NFC award, effective administration, development in remote area, access of

(19)

Date: _____

of equal opportunities to the poor people, and national integration.

Creation of new provinces will ensure equal distribution of resources. It will also integrate the country by infusing the sense in the minds of Seraikis, Pashtun, Mahajir and Hazaras community in the country. This can prevent them from taking any drastic step. Secondly, to demand autonomous administration is not an unconstitutional thing.

They can forward their reservations over the unjust distribution of provincial budget within various areas of the province. Thus giving them autonomous provinces can bring them into mainstream national politics.

Another prospect of creation of new provinces on the health of the state will come in the

Date: _____

shape of self rule. When the people of the areas will be allowed to exercise the provincial autonomy thus ruling themselves, they can better decide their lives keeping in view ~~of~~ their resources and needs. This thing will keep them busy in healthy local politics and prevent secession. So, by creating new provinces, we can contain the political upheaval and social unrest.

Thirdly, creation of new provinces will ensure better ~~act~~ administration as large provinces are difficult to administer ~~them~~ well. Creating new provinces will divide the power. The power will trickle down to the bottom and empower the local government. Doing so will ensure better administration and will devolve the power to local government. This will bring fortune to the people of

Date: _____

the area without transmission of the resources and revenue to other autonomous parts of the provinces. Utilizing the resources according to the needs of the area will bring development in the areas. Creating new provinces will also ensure basic facilities to the far flung areas. They will enjoy education, health and other basic facilities.

Last but not least, creation of new provinces will strengthen the national integration. As people enjoy job opportunities in their areas they don't travel too long to approach provincial for some purpose. They will enjoy health facilities and education facilities in their areas as they don't feel marginalized so, the country will free from the political upheaval and social unrest. They could enjoy all the basic facilities.

Date: _____

In their areas

There are multiple challenges to the creation of new provinces in the country: vested interest of politicians, lack of political will, funds issues, feudalism, ethnicity, and disintegration among political parties.

Vested interest of political parties is one of the most significant barrier in the way of creation of new provinces.

The political parties fear that their influence will contain if new provinces to be created in the country. It will further deteriorate the national integration. For instance, the demand for creation of new province in South Punjab encouraged by Pakistan Peoples Party to contain the influence of Pakistan Muslim League in Punjab, the largest province in terms of population. On the other hand, Pakistan

Date: _____

Muslim League Nawaz supports to the Sindh province to limit the hegemony of the PPP in Sindh. So, the creation of new province is politicised by political parties. This underscores the vested interest of political parties which led the demand of new provinces falter and unfruitful in the country. Similarly, lack of political will is another most significant cause against the creation of new provinces. The political parties has not paid attention towards creation of new provinces in the country. The debate on the creation of new provinces went to longer as the demand for creation of new provinces emerged after the 18th amendment in 2010 when powers were made decentralized. In 2012, a commission was constituted to amend the constitution for creation of new province in the country.

Pakistan is going through

Date: _____

The commission was comprising on six MNAs, six senators, and two MPAs but still no consensus was made among the political parties on the creation of new provinces. The creation of the province of the South Punjab is recommended but still not in proper. PMLN, the major political party of Punjab, is a big barrier in the creation of new province of South Punjab. It will contain the hegemony of the party. Likewise, PPP is a major hurdle in the way of creation of new province in Karachi as it would limit the influence of PPP in Sindh province. This shows the lack of political will to the creation of new province in the country. Lack of political will is proved to be a big obstacle to the creation of new provinces. Pakistan is going through its worst

Date: _____

economic, political and social issues Pakistan, a country mired in debt and poverty, does not make progress economically and politically. The state owned enterprises are facing crisis like railways, PIA and energy sector. The country faces 100 billion loss by state owned enterprises. Energy sector badly hit the country's economy and led the country into poverty. According to World Bank report 40 percent of the population of the country lives below the poverty line, and 24 percent in extreme poverty. According to FY 2023, the country owed to Rs. 59000 billion of public and national debt. Shortage of funds is the main barrier in the way of creation of new provinces. The country's economic situation is meeting the demands of the four provinces as a contention remains

Date: _____

between the center and provinces on the issue of NFC award. Provinces claim to their share, but the center deals with many problem like debt. Consequently lack of fund is major obstacle in the way creation of new provinces.

Feudalism is another significant barrier in the way of creation of new provinces. As the creation of new province will affect the influence of the feudal lords. They want to make influence in the country. So, they can create hurdles in the way of creation of new provinces which hinder the development of the country.

Feudalism has always been an obstacle in the way of country's progress. So, it highlights, the feudalism is also a big barrier in the way of creation of new provinces. Accordingly, ethnicity is also

Date: _____

another big barrier in the creation of new provinces. As ethnicity can lead to disintegration in the country, it will give rise to the ethnicity in the country. Creating of new provinces on the basis of ethnicity will be harmful to the country's nationalism. For instance, India formed a commission ~~on~~ "Linguistic Provincial Commission" on the creation of new provinces on ethnic basis. It rejected the proposal for two times on the basis of ethnic. The rejection led the India to the ~~dead~~ resentment of the ethnic people and this caused the death of president of the Commission of Linguistic Provincial. In Pakistan, the contention of Urdu Bengali led the country to secession in 1971. In 1950s, Ayub Khan formed a One unit policy to reduce the administrative costs and ~~the~~ ~~judges~~

the creation

Date: _____

Some other issues to the creation of new provinces in the country. creation of new provinces in Punjab will ~~hard~~ hurt irrigation as Punjab is already facing a shortage of water. and Sindh too. All the provinces claim their share of water. Sindh alleges Punjab for theft of its share of water. creation of new provinces will lead the country to further shortage of water, it will harm the national integration. Further, creation of new provinces will impact the composition of Senate, National Finance Commission, National Election Commission, National Economic Council, and Council of Common Interest and Economic Coordination Committee. So, creation of new provinces will create further challenges to the state.

Although there are multiple challenges to the creation of new provinces,

Date: _____

the country has potential to deal with the challenge faced by the policy makers. Creation of new provinces should be on the basis of administrative, political, poverty and backwardness and cultural.

Pakistan is facing administrative crisis since its creation 1947. The country has been facing leadership crisis for 75 years, as Quaid-e-Azam Muhammad Ali said "I have a fake coins in my pocket". The creation of new provinces should be based on administrative ~~basis~~. It will improve the country's administrative system. The administrative system would be better by empowering to the local government. When local government empowers the administrative system functions smoothly, people will enjoy power at local level. By doing so the country's administration

Date: _____

may be better. According to Global Governance Index, Pakistan ranked 144 out of 193 countries.

The population of Punjab is more than that 150 countries in the world and the area of Balochistan is more than 140 countries. If

we see around us we will find Iran, western country of Pakistan, has 31 provinces and Afghanistan 34 provinces, India 28 plus 6 union territories and China 34 provinces.

According to dawn newspaper, there are 28 divisions in the country these are to be made provinces. It will prove fruitful in the country.

Similarly, new provinces should be made on political grounds in the country. This will create representation to the people in the backward areas. Political representation in Senate and National Assembly will reach the backward areas.

Date: _____

to development in the country. When representation of the backward areas will be in the upper and lower house they will highlight the issues of the backward areas like poverty, unemployment and health and education issues. So, creation of new provinces on political basis will improve the living standard and infrastructure in the backward areas that demand for the creation of new provinces. Therefore, the policy makers should keep in mind political representation while creation of new provinces.

To avoid ethnicity while creation of new provinces it would be better the province of Punjab to be divided into Ravi, Punjab and Cholistan provinces. As already Punjab is called the land of five Rivers. It will lead the country to the national integration.

nation of resources, state
award, effective administration

Date: _____

In conclusion, Following the merger of Fata with KP, it has intensified the creation of new province in the country, whether it is on ethnic and or administrative basis. The demand for the creation of new province first comes from South Punjab as a Saraiki province, in KP Hazara province, in Sindh Mahajir province and in Balochistan Pashtun province. There are multiple cause of the demands at the creation of new provinces in the country like backwardness, long distance to the provincial capital, backwardness and lack of basic facilities like education, health and other basic necessities. There are prospects and challenges to the creation of new provinces in the country. Prospects of new provinces are equal distribution of resources, share of NFC award, effective administration

Date: _____

infrastructure development, economic opportunities, job creation in new provinces, reduce the gap, and poor people enjoy basic facilities like education, health and basic necessities at their doorstep. However, there are multiple challenges to the creation of new provinces in the country like lack of funds, lack of political will, vested interest of the political parties, ethnic and linguistic problems and feudalism. However, the country has potential to deal with the challenges by taking such steps for the creation of new provinces. These include administrative, political ~~and~~ backwardness, lack of devets and constitutional steps. The creation of new provinces should be based on political, sustainable development, administrative, backwardness and lack basic facilities