

Pak Affairs

BPSC part paper.

Q. (a) Write down Mr. Jinnah's famous Fourteen points. (10)

Ans:

1) Introduction:

Muhammad Ali Jinnah, the stalwart leader of the All-India Muslim League, articulated a set of demands in 1929, amidst the political turbulence of British India, known as the famous Fourteen points. Jinnah's Fourteen points emerged as a pivotal document, laying down the foundation for the Muslim League's pursuit of safeguards, representation and autonomy in a future constitutional framework. Here are the Fourteen points:

- 1) The form of the future constitution should be federal with all the residuary powers vested in the provinces.
- 2) A uniform measure of autonomy shall be granted to all provinces.
- 3) Adequate and effective representation should be given to all the minorities in all the assemblies and all other elected bodies of the country and no efforts should be made to reduce the majority of a community.

- 4) At least one-third seats in the central legislature should be reserved for the Muslims.
- 5) The presentation of communal groups should continue by means of separate electorate, provided that it should be open to any community to abandon its separate electorate in favour of joint electorates.
- 6) Any territorial redistribution that might be necessary should not effect the Muslim majority in Bengal, Punjab and North-West Frontier Province (NWFP).
- 7) Full religious freedom shall be guaranteed to all communities.
- 8) No bill or resolution shall be passed in any legislature if three-fourths of the Muslim representatives oppose it.
- 9) Sindh should be separated from the Bombay Presidency.
- 10) Reforms should also be introduced in the N.W.F.P and Balochistan on the same footing as in other provinces.
- 11) Provision should be made in the Constitution giving the Muslims an adequate share along with other Indians in all the services.
- 12) The constitution should embody adequate

Safeguards for the protection of Muslim's culture, education, language and personal law.

13) No cabinet, either Central or Provincial should be formed without there being a proportion of Muslim ministers of at least one-third.

14) No change or amendment should be made in the constitution by the central legislature except with the concurrence of the states (Provinces).

Conclusion:

In retrospect, Muhammad Ali Jinnah's Fourteen points stand as a testament to his foresight and commitment to securing the rights of the Muslim community in British India. While not all of the Fourteen points were realized in the entirety, they played a crucial role in shaping subsequent negotiations and discussions leading up to the creation of Pakistan in 1947.

Q. (b) Write down a note on Nehru report. Discuss the difference between Nehru report and Jinnah's Fourteen points.

Ans:

1) Introduction:

The Nehru report, presented in 1928, was a crucial milestone in the constitutional history of British India. The report was a response to the Simon Commission, which was criticized for having no Indian representation. The Nehru report represented a significant attempt to forge a consensus among India's diverse communities.

2) Dominion status:

A central feature of the Nehru report was the demand for Dominion status for India within the British Commonwealth. This implied self-governance with a constitutional link to the British crown.

3) Federal structure:

The Nehru committee proposed a unitary form of government making the central government all powerful. In addition, it also proposed to invest

all the residuary powers in the central government. However, the provinces were to have a substantial degree of autonomy in local matters

4) Provincial Autonomy:

Each province was to have its own legislative and executive responsible for a range of subjects. The provinces were granted autonomy in managing their internal affairs

5) Separate Electorate:

The Nehru report declared the separate electorate injurious for the minorities. It claimed "since separate electorate awakens communal sentiments, therefore, it should be scrapped and Joint electorate should be introduced

6) Reservation of Seats:

While the Nehru report supported separate electorates for religious minorities, it also allowed individuals from these communities to contest in general constituencies. This approach aimed to balance minority rights and promote joint electorates.

7) Separation of Sindh from Bombay:

The Nehru report concluded that Sindh be separated from

Bombay on the basis of language and aspiration of the inhabitants, 74% of the population was Muslim. This demand was also favoured by the parsons of Bombay.

8) Rejection of 1/3 Representation of the Muslims:

The Muslim had demanded that they should be given 1/3rd representation in the Central Legislature. The Nehru Committee rejected this demand on the plea that Muslims formed less than one-fourth of the population and can not be given one-third representation.

9) Language:

The Nehru report recommended Hindi in Devanagari script as the official language, while also recognizing the importance of regional languages.

10) Nehru report - Critique:

The report regarded Muslim's problems as purely religious and cultural (communal) matter which should be cured by full religious liberty and cultural autonomy. On 12-03-1947 when the report was debated in the Indian Legislative Assembly all Muslim

members including Jinnah rejected it.

Difference between Nehru Report and Jinnah's Fourteen Points.

The Nehru report and Jinnah's Fourteen points were both important documents during the early 20th century in British India, but they represented contrasting visions for the future of the country and rights of its various communities.

(i) Context and Purpose:

The Nehru report aimed for a united and independent India with a center. It sought to present a constitution acceptable to all communities and promote the idea of single, secular nation. While, Jinnah aimed to protect the interests of the Muslim community and address their concerns within the context of a predominantly Hindu-majority India.

(ii) Approach to Representation:

The Nehru report proposed a system of joint electorates with reservation of seats for religious minorities in the legislatures. It emphasized the idea of a single electorate in which all citizens, regardless of their religion, would vote for their representatives. Jinnah's Fourteen points on the other hand, called for separate electorates.

for Muslims ensuring that they could elect their own representatives to safeguard their interest

(iii) Autonomy and Federalism:

The Nehru Report envisioned a centralized and unitary form of government for India, with limited autonomy for provinces and it emphasized on a strong center with significant powers. Jinnah's Fourteen points called for a federal structure with autonomous provinces where residuary power would be vested in the provinces

(iv) Protection of Minority Rights:

The Nehru Report emphasized the protection of minority rights through constitution. It aimed to provide equal rights for all communities, irrespective of their religion or linguistic backgrounds. Jinnah's points sought to address the concerns of the Muslim minorities specifically. It demanded adequate representation for Muslims in legislature, protection of Muslim's culture and personal laws

(v) Approach to National Identity:

The Nehru Report emphasized a common national identity based on shared values and aspirations. Jinnah's Fourteen points, while not explicitly rejecting the idea of united India, emphasized the distinct identity and interest of the Muslim community

(vi) Conclusion:

The Nehru Report presented a vision for a united and centralized India with equal rights for all communities. While, Jinnah's points advocated for the protection of Muslim interests through separate electorate, increase autonomy for provinces, protection of personal law and culture. These contrasting approaches played a significant role for the creation of Pakistan.