

# Civil–Military Relations in Pakistan

Mohammad Ali Babakhel



## Civil –military interventions

- ▶ Chile,Brazil,Egypt,Ghana,Nigeria,Turkey,Syria, Thailand, Indonesia, North Korea and Pakistan repeatedly experienced disruption of civilian rule and imposition of military regimes



## Civil–Military Relations in Pakistan

- ▶ Vacuum of democratic leadership:
  - i. Demise of Jinnah 11<sup>th</sup> September 1948
  - ii. Demise of Liaqat 16<sup>th</sup> October 1951
  - iii. With the demise of Liaqat the facade of Parliamentary democracy started eroded
  - iv. Second line leadership could not translate the political vision into democratic reality
  - v. Bureaucratic intervention
  - vi. Governor rule in provinces, despite majority in house CMs were dismissed

## Provincialism

- ▶ Geographic separation
- ▶ East & West wings
- ▶ Economic disparity
- ▶ Instead of political solutions bureaucratic–military solutions were explored
- ▶ Deprivation, alienation converted into separatist movement
- ▶ Constitution making delayed for 9 years
- ▶ East Pak demanded maximum provincial autonomy
- ▶ West Pak advocated strong center
- ▶ East Pak had 54 % population demanded adult franchise
- ▶ Military intervention

Provincialism

Punjabi–Bengali controversy

## West & East Pakistan (*as on 1961*)


	Territory	Population
West Pakistan	310,403 sq mile	43 million
East Pakistan	55,126 sq mile	50.9 million

Source  
<http://www.jstor.org>


## Long military rule

- ▶ 33 years long military rule
- ▶ 3 military coups(1958,1977,1999)
- ▶ Pakistan Army equipped with nuclear power
- ▶ After independence eruption of Cold war era
- ▶ After demise of Jinnah+ Liaqat office of Governor General became instrumental for creating hurdles for democratic process

## Civil–military strife

- ▶ During 1951–58 two Governor Generals (Ghulam Mohd & Iskandar Mirza) but 7 Premieres were replaced
  - ▶ Army primarily consists of martial races (Punjab+ KPK)
  - ▶ Impression of military superiority over politicians
  - ▶ Democracy via GHQ?
  - ▶ Strong centralized internal command & control
- 

## Civil–Military Relations in Pakistan

- ▶ External threats
  - ▶ Internal threats
  - ▶ Situation strengthened military as a strong institution
- 

## Highly organized military

- ▶ Army entrenched itself into the state
- ▶ Suspended constitutions
- ▶ Imposed military rule
- ▶ Brought own constitutional recipes
- ▶ Into profit venture projects
- ▶ Established NSC –2004

## PAKISTAN



## Indian Factor

- ▶ India regarded as an existential threat to Pakistan
- ▶ Hindu-Muslim antagonism
- ▶ Kashmir dispute
- ▶ Wars 1947-65-71-99
- ▶ Cross border terrorism



## Internal Factors

- ▶ Demise of Jinnah
- ▶ Assassination of Liaqat
- ▶ With demise of Liaqat the parliamentary era came to an end
- ▶ Bureaucratic interventions started
- ▶ Governors rule imposed, chief ministers dismissed
- ▶ Distance between 2 wings gave birth to number of administrative, political and constitutional problems



## Internal threats

- ▶ East Pakistan
- ▶ Greater Pakhtunkhwa
- ▶ FATA
- ▶ Baluchistan
- ▶ Karachi
- ▶ Growing Extremism
- ▶ Increased influence of VNSAs
- ▶ Sectarian & ethnic divide
- ▶ Internal security duties

## Civil–military divide

- ▶ Policies were primarily west –Pakistan centric
- ▶ Increased frustration & deprivation in East–Pak
- ▶ Delayed constitution making
- ▶ Increased gulf between Punjabi elite & Bengali egalitarian leadership
- ▶ East Pak demanded maximum provincial autonomy & West Pak desired strong center



## East–West Pak –vested interests

- ▶ Quantum of representation: East Pak had 54 pc population hence demanded universal adult franchise but leadership of west Pak was reluctant



## Bad era for Parliamentary democracy

- ▶ From 1951–58 , two Governor Generals , 1 Army chief and 7 Premiers were changed
- ▶ Emergence of Ghulam Mohammad followed by Iskandar Mirza paved the path for military interventions
- ▶ Stage was set for military who had been working in background
- ▶ Initially Ayub Khan was reluctant to come into limelight





## Political vacuum

- ▶ In 1954 political forces wanted to reduce the powers of GG but GG dissolved the constituent assembly
- ▶ PML lost its public standing – a political party vacuum
- ▶ PML who provided a platform for the masses to attain a separate homeland failed to transform itself from a movement to a party




## Role of Judiciary


- ▶ 1955 Maulvi Tamiz uddin case Justice Munir upheld the arbitrary decision of GG GM of the dissolution of first constituent assembly
- ▶ It was carried out in the light of “Doctrine of necessity”
- ▶ It opened doors for civil & military interventions
- ▶ Role of judiciary from 1950’s to 2007 (ouster of Ch Iftikhar remained under critical review



## Failure of politicians

- ▶ PML failed to lead the nation for constitutionalism & economic development
  - ▶ PML lost its democratic ideals ,had annual conventions but after independence in 9 years no convention
  - ▶ Factional politics- inner infighting within PML
  - ▶ Widespread impression regarding corruption & inefficiency of politicians
- 

## Civil & military intervention

- ▶ In the wake of weakening political culture country rapidly became dependent upon the **civil & military bureaucratic support**
  - ▶ Such need created space for civil & military interventions
  - ▶ Political parties failed to flourish as democratic entities
  - ▶ Successors of Jinnah failed to translate the ideals of Jinnah
- 

## Absence of autonomous election commission

- ▶ 11 years no elections
- ▶ No autonomous election commission
- ▶ One part of COD – had focus on electoral reforms
- ▶ Ongoing strife between government & PTI primarily revolves around ‘reforms in ECP’



## International factors

- ▶ Cold war
- ▶ Era of non aligned movement (NAM–1979)
- ▶ Pakistan became member of military pacts
  - i. South East Asia Treaty Organization (SEATO)
  - ii. CENTO (central treaty Organization) 1955–79
  - iii. In post USSR invasion in Afghanistan ,Pak became strong US ally
  - iv. In post 9/11 scenario Pakistan front line state in ongoing WOT



- ▶ Pro-US military establishment
- ▶ Conspiracy theories



## Military courts

- ▶ Through a constitutional amendments military courts established
- ▶ Challenged in Apex Court
- ▶ 11-6 ruling
- ▶ Court validated military courts
- ▶ Verdict will help counter -terror efforts



## Sindh

- ▶ Ongoing Rangers led operation in Karachi
- ▶ Extension to Rangers in Sindh gave birth to new controversy between Sindh & Center between civil & military relations
- ▶ Are hopes after 18<sup>th</sup> amendment evaporating ?
- ▶ Is Pakistan again heading towards another phase of hostilities between center-provinces



### Poor capacity of civilian institutions

- |  |   |
|--|---|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▶ Army was employed for relief and recovery operation during 1948, 1950, 1955, 1956, 1973, 1975, 1976, 1978, 1998, 1992, 1995, 1998, 2001, 2003, 2010 and 2011 &amp; 2014 floods</li> </ul> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▶ Anti-terrorism operations</li> <li>▶ Deployment during elections</li> <li>▶ Policing functions</li> <li>▶ Establishment of Special Security Division (10,000 persons)</li> </ul> |
|--|---|

Disaster management

Other areas

## Chronology

- ▶ Ayub Khan's rule 1958-69
- ▶ Yahiya's rule 1969-71
- ▶ Zia's rule 1977-88
- ▶ Mushraf's rule 1999-08
- ▶ Wars
- ▶ Ousted Junejo,ZAB,NS,BB
- ▶ Political movements MRD,ARD
- ▶ Devolution 2001-02
- ▶ Police Order (2002)
- ▶ Akbar Bugti's death
- ▶ Lal Masjid Operation
- ▶ 8<sup>th</sup> & 17<sup>th</sup> amendment
- ▶ Judicial activism

## WAYFORWARD

- ▶ National Security Council needs to be made operational & effective
- ▶ More transparent constitutionally defined roles
- ▶ Implementation of COD