

Ethnic Issues and National Integration

Mohammad Ali Babakhel

National integration

- After independence from colonial masters ,**national integration** remained an elusive ideal
- Ethnic & sectarian **diversity**
- Ethnic issues were provoked by authoritarian rules
- States adopted different approaches & strategies
- In the creation of national integration Pakistan is also facing problems

Ethnicity

- While responding **authoritarian** policy, ethnic groups provoked ethnic politics & started movements for the preservation of their identity.
- Ethnic movements become a **challenge** to the national integration.

National integration is a complex process

- Weiner (1965) refers the term **integration** as, “a process that unites culturally & socially discrete groups into a territorial unit. In this way, the established national identity is helpful to overcome the problems between central authority and subordinate political groups. In addition to that it links the government with governed “

Features

- wider national interests are safeguarded
- national integration is a process of nation building
- national identity becomes more important rather than ethnic
- In USA ethnically diverse groups, with different back grounds merged in **American identity** and are sharing equally the democratic rights
- However in developing societies “ethnicity “ posed serious threat to national integration
- In South Asia & Africa ethnic issues challenged national integration

Role of political parties

- In such fragmented societies parties failed to motivate followers to associate them with the state.

Ethno –lingual groups in Pakistan

Ethnic Group	% (in 1981)	Number of speakers (millions) 1993
Panjabi	48.17	60.9
Pashto	13.14	16.8
Sindhi	11.77	15.0
Siraiki	9.83	12.6
Urdu	7.60	9.7
Blochi	3.02	3.8
Hindko	2.43	13.1
Brahvi	1.21	1.5
Others	2.81	3.6

Language & politics in Pakistan
Karachi: Oxford university Press

Federal interventions in provinces

Year	Description
1947	Congress ministry in NWFP had 'the support of 33 members out of 50.' But it was replaced by a Muslim League ministry.
1947	<u>Sindh assembly opposed the decision of central government to take Karachi out of control of Sindh and passed a resolution unanimously .</u> The Chief Minister of Sindh had to pay for this resolution and he was dismissed soon.
1948	Inclusion of Kallat state (91909 sq km) into Pakistan.
1955	One-unit scheme (amalgamation of provinces and states into the province of West Pakistan.)
1962-69	Ayub's Presidential period (Federal system operated like British vice regal system of 1930s.)
1970-71	Military action in East Pakistan and its separation.

Federal interventions in provinces

Year	Description
1972-73	dissolution of Baluchistan government. NWFP government resigned as protest.
1977-88	Constitutional amendments by military regime undermined the parliamentary and Federal nature of the constitution.
1988-93	Dissolution of provincial assemblies (1988,90,93)
1994	<u>Governor rule in NWFP</u> and installation of favorable government.
1995	<u>Governor rule in Punjab</u> and installation of new government.
1999	<u>Removal of Nawaz Sharif</u> government along provincial government.
2002	17th Amendment has undermined the federal character of the state.

Some considerable Ethno-lingual-Nationalist movements :Nature of Conflicts

Period	Nature of conflict
1973-1977 2002-2005 Baloch Baluchistan	Insurgency against central government which was forcefully crushed by PPP Government major reasons of revived movement are denial of adequate representation in the government. Political Migration, issue of royalty of natural resources, Target killing. Afghan refugees
1973 74-77 2009-2010 Pashtun Hindko KPK	Counteraction to dismissal of elected government and against intervention in provincial matters. Hazara sooba movement on the basis of Hindko dialect

Some considerable Ethno-lingual-Nationalist movements: Nature of Conflicts

Period	Nature of conflict
1980-1985 2003Mohajir(Urban Sindh)	Against the central authorities lack of representation in bureaucracy and Army against <u>quota system</u> , loss of <u>identity</u> , killings in Karachi.
1960-70 1988-2009 To date Saraiki (Southern Punjab)	To gain language rights against Punjabi <u>dominance and creation of separate province, Siraikistan.</u>

Approaches to National Integration & State Strategies

Modernist school of thought

- Discusses primarily, societal trends
- They want to convert different social, cultural linguistic and religious groups into a **congruous whole**

Assimilation policy

- Based on **social integration**
- **Different cultures** are to be incorporated with national culture
- It is helpful to eradicate estrangement & **unifying** the society
- **France** successfully tried it
- After French revolution govts assimilated the minorities
- Centralized cultural & educational policies
- In Turkey (urban) areas Kurdish minorities accepted assimilated policy however in certain parts they did demand recognition of **Kurdish language & culture**.
- It seems **alluring**
- Some minorities accept it **voluntarily** but when imposed they may react
- In **1948** when one **national language was imposed** it led to dismemberment in 1971

Exclusionary Policy

- To minimize contacts with minorities
- Process to eliminate ethnic minorities
- Policy of segregation
- Physical genocide
- **Rwanda** -1990-1994
- 800000 killed
- In **USA** policy of segregation against Negroes

Pluralist policy

- Diverse interest groups are accommodated by the state
- **federal form** of govt are widely accepted to resolve the ethnic problems
- 2 or more ethnic groups develop consensus ,recognize rights of each other & form a govt
- High degree of autonomy for each segment

Federalism-ethnicity in Pakistan

- Accommodates **diversity**
 - To regulate ethnic divide
 - Defines relationship between center & provinces
 - Objectives resolution
 - Constitutions
 - Ethnicity overpowered the religious fever
 - **Instrumentalist approach**
 - I. Elite /state uses ethnicity to get power
 - Ethnicity proved a **divisive factor**
 - Religion & language important attributes to nationhood
 - After independence declaration of “**Urdu “ as national language** threatened other regional languages
 - Transformation of loyalty to state to regional or social identities.
-
- Muslim nationalism lost significance
 - Multi-lingual-ethnic composition
 - Emergence of **Bengali ethnic politics**
 - Bengali **nationalism**
 - Based on **secular connotation**
 - Focused on **cultural identity & language**
 - East Pak considered itself as a periphery ,colonized by West Pakistan
 - One Unit plan

Language Movement

- A movement launched for the advocacy of Bengali language to be recognized as an **official language**
- In **1948** the Government declared Urdu as sole official language, sparked violent protests
- 21 Feb 1952 students of Dhaka University were killed by Police firing
- Language movement was a base for **6 Point Formula** & Bengali nationalism
- Out of **69** million 44 million were Bengali
- 21 Feb. celebrated as Language movement day
- Economic imbalance
- Mukti Bahni

1973 constitution

- | | |
|--|---|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Federal system • Division of power • Bicameral legislature • Conflict resolution apparatus • Senate had no authority over <u>finance & budget</u> • 17th amendment- money bills now presented to the Senate | <p><u>National Economic Council (NEC)</u>
<u>Article # 156</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Headed by PM, all 4 CMs and representation from all provinces • Shall at least meet twice • Body to promote <u>economic development</u> • Reassessment of economic conditions & devise policies for economic development |
|--|---|

Council of Common Interests(CCI): Article # 153

- CMs, equal number of federal ministers
- empowered to look into the complaints regarding oil,gas.water supply.

Senate

- Equal Voting rights of the provinces(irrespective of the population)
- Representation of all shades of political opinion
- Protector of the rights of federating units
- Guards encroachment on the part of center
- Encourages participatory federalism
- Joint ownership of natural resources

- Senate struggled for the role in Public Accounts Committee
- 18th amendment obligates Auditor General to present annual report in both houses
- Inclusion of Senators in Public Accounts Committee

National finance Commission(NFC): Article 160

- PM+ federal & Provincial Finance ministers and other members to advise on distribution of revenues between centre & units
- Distribution on basis of population Provinces which is highly contentious
- The previous NFC Award, signed in 2009, expired on June 30, 2015 and has continued to remain effective through presidential extension. At present, the Centre transfers 57.5pc of the divisible pool to the provinces after deducting collection charges and retains 42.5pc. Of the provincial share, 82pc is distributed on the basis of population, 10.3pc on the basis of poverty, 5pc for revenue collection and 2.7pc inverse population density (area). (Source Daily Dawn 29th November 2016)

Polices to create unity

National Language Policy	To promote Urdu as national language –to promote unity	Not accepted- birth to Bengali nationalism
One Unit Plan	Centralisation- integrate 2 wings	Alienated Bengalis- little share in power
Federal Capital		Sense of deprivation in East Pakistan
Powerful civil-military bureaucracy	Little representation of Bengalis	Dissatisfaction
Elections	PPP + AL did not accept results	Dismemberment

Post 18th amendment

- To satisfy ethnic groups
- Renamed NWFP as KP
- Hazara province movement
- Creation of new provinces debate

- Identity crisis
- Quest for financial autonomy
- Demand for administrative autonomy
- Tainted concept of accountability & transparency

National Integration

- Standardization of outlines of curriculum
- Sports
- Tourism
- Free movement(Right to movement)
- Positive role of media
- Professional federal service/good governance
- Communication network
- Transparent census

- Role of federal political parties
- Respect for human rights
- Constitutional protections(18th amendment)
- Constitutional Conflict resolution apparatus
- National heroes
- Role of social media
- Respect for leadership
- Law enforcement
- Equal application of law

- Voice of minorities
- Army
- CPEC