

Political Science

Lecture 12

Montesquieu

- Charles-Louis de Secondat, Baron de Montesquieu (19th Jan, 1689 to 10th Feb 1755)
- Focused on **Constitutional politics**
- Crafted the theory of **Separation of powers**
- Notable works:
 - *The Persian Letters* 1721
 - *Considerations on the Causes of the Greatness of the Romans and their Decline* 1734
 - *The Spirit of Laws* 1748.
- Influenced the constitution of USA
- Laid out the principle of separation of powers to protect liberty of individuals
- Rejected all forms of a priori principles and laws
- Approached laws and law-making in a scientific manner
- Focused on practical rather than ideal solutions

Montesquieu

- Position on Laws:
 - Man needs laws to fulfill two basic needs:
 - Natural Law to regulate the relationship between man and God
 - Positive Law to regulate the relationships among men
 - Political society is a natural product. When it comes into being, tendency for war emerges.
 - Hence, law is required for regulation and protection of liberty
 - Kinds of law:
 - Int'l law
 - Political Law (between government and the governed)
 - Civil law (to regulate inter-personal conduct of citizens)

Montesquieu

- Position on Laws:
 - Government is necessary to provide political and civil law
 - Laws, to be just, must be adaptable to changing circumstances (laws should be contextualised and society specific)
 - In promulgation of laws, the “spirit” of laws, rather than the subject-matter, should be focused on
 - Best government is that, *“which best agrees with the humor and disposition of the people in whose favour it is established.”*
 - *The deterioration of a government begins almost always by the decay of its principles.” – Montesquieu*

Montesquieu

- Nature and Principle of Government:
 - Classification
 - Monarchy – works on the rule of law
 - Despotism – works without law
 - Republic – franchise and size of government may vary between a democracy and an aristocracy
 - Governing Principles
 - Republic – virtue of the people (patriotism, general interest, equality, self restraint etc.)
 - In democracy, virtue must be widespread
 - In aristocracy, virtue must be widespread in those wielding power

Montesquieu

- Nature and Principle of Government:
 - Governing Principles
 - Monarchy– honour
 - Reaping collective benefits through the synchronization of the interests of the monarch and the public
 - Despotism – fear
 - Laws and general interest is replaced by the whim of the despot
 - Laws and the form of government
 - Republic (especially democracy) should have laws that:
 - Limit inequality
 - Educational laws that promote unity and patriotism
 - In aristocracy, laws should limit concentration of power and wealth in the ruling elite

Montesquieu

- Nature and Principle of Government:
 - Laws and the form of government
 - Monarchy
 - Educational laws should promote enlightened self-interest, that would be in favour of the general good
 - Laws make liberty possible, therefore comprehensive sets of laws are required for democracies and monarchies
 - Forced equality can create instability
 - A “natural aristocracy” should lead the government in order to avoid corruption and fall of the regime.
 - Government and Size of the State
 - Size of a state should neither be too small, nor too big
 - Small states are prone to occupation, large ones are prone to internal disunion
 - Monarchy must be moderate in territory
 - If the size is small, a republic may be established
 - If the size is too large, a confederacy may be formed

Montesquieu

- Theory of Separation of Powers
 - Since laws make liberty possible, by breaking laws, society reverts to the state of nature where liberty does not exist.
 - Despotism is government without laws, therefore a constitution is required to hinder lawlessness and reversion of society back to the state of nature.
 - It is not just power that must be separated, but also the bodies that wield these powers
 - *“Every man invested with power is bound to abuse it, and to carry his authority as far as it will go.”*
 - *“When legislative and executive powers are united in the same body, there can be no liberty.”*

Montesquieu

- Theory of Separation of Powers
 - Legislature:
 - Carries the general will of the people
 - Representative legislature
 - Bi-cameral – popular and aristocratic
 - Called in by the monarch
 - Cannot appoint executive branch, although it may review executive processes
 - Executive:
 - Puts the general will into action
 - Judiciary:
 - Chosen by the people
 - “Fear the office, not the magistrate”

Montesquieu

- Theory of Separation of Powers
 - Peculiar powers for the Upper house:
 - Trials of nobles to be carried out in upper house
 - Appellate authority for lower courts' judgments
 - Impeachment tribunal for cases initiated by lower house

Montesquieu

- Montesquieu as the Aristotle of 18th Century:
 - Followed the inductive and historical methods of Aristotle
 - Focuses on the influence of physical environment on the social institutions
 - Classified governments into various types according to their features
 - Laws are essential for a healthy political system
 - Laws are subject to the context of the society and political values
 - Laws are universal in their presence but vary in their nature

Ibn Khaldun

- Abu Zaid Abd-al-Rahman Ibn-e-Khaldun
- Born in Tunis, Tunisia, in 1332, died in Cairo on March 17, 1406
- Works:
 - Kitab-al-Ibrar.....It is a universal history written in seven volumes, the introduction to this work entitled Muqaddamah.
 - al-Taarif
 - History of the Berbers
- Maliki jurist, remained a judge in Cairo, haafiz
- Studied history, politics and society systematically
- The first true historian– history as something which is to be studied and understood not just narrated
- Considered the father of sociology by many, as well as the father of economics
- Remained unnoticed in his own time, was discovered by later Muslim philosophers

Ibn Khaldun

- Contribution to Political Thought:
 - Marked clear distinction between rural and urban life and recognized the necessity of the latter for the emergence of civilization and a state in the strict sense of the term.
 - Regarded Asabiya as the main driving principle for political activity.
 - Explained the causal interdependence among several factors of social life like economic, military, cultural and religious etc. in the state.

Ibn Khaldun

- Contribution to Political Thought:
 - Projection of Islam as grounds for a universal human civilization
 - Distinction between state on political power alone and state based on prophetic laws
 - Analysis of the Islamic political system
 - Laid the foundations of political economy
 - Proposing the part religion should play in the life of the state, in transforming Asabiya into a durable and cohesive power
 - Analysis of the cycle of society
 - Impact of physical environment on the temperament of people and society (by extension their political culture)

Ibn Khaldun

- Stages of Society
 - Man is by nature a political/social animal. It means that it is necessary for individuals to associate themselves with other individuals in order to fulfill mutual needs and interests
 - Society is governed by “Asabiya” – social solidarity/cohesion. This “we-feeling” keeps the society intact.
 - Asabiya is stronger in small, nomadic communities and grows weaker as societies expand.
 - Asabiya is strongest in blood bonds
 - Each civilization has in it the seeds for its own demise
 - Civilizations typically follow a 120 year long cycle (or four generations), after which they collapse and start anew

Ibn Khaldun

- Stages of Society
 - First Stage (conquest)
 - Solidarity is still largely based on a Asabiya
 - Leadership is exemplary, commands the loyalty of people
 - Transition from rural to urban, settled life
 - Second Stage (state-building)
 - Rule is consolidated, asabiya is still intact but is used a means for state-building
 - Division between ruler and ruled become wider
 - Third Stage (peak)
 - Leader starts acquiring wealth and fame
 - Building of civilization – monuments, public works
 - Start of a luxurious life for ruler and people

Ibn Khaldun

- Stages of Society

- Fourth Stage (decline)

- Ruler and ruled are satisfied with what has been built by their ancestors
 - Dependence on luxurious life

- Fifth Stage (fall)

- Dependence on luxury and comforts eventually renders the leadership and public incapacitated
 - Luxurious spending may eventually lead to political instability and bring the whole regime down with it
 - External aggression or internal disunion may set in

“When a nation has become the victim of a psychological defeat, then that marks the end of a nation.”

Ibn Khaldun

- Political Economy
 - Understood the interconnection of politics and economics
 - Prefaced the thought of Adam Smith and David Ricardo
 - Role of capital and labor in Economy:
 - Highlighted the role capital and labor play in the economy
 - “The part of the income that is obtained by a person through his own effort and strength is called profit. When a particular person enjoys its fruits by spending it upon his interest and need, it is called sustenance. Thus it is the part of the profit that is utilized. If the profit results from something other than a craft, the value of the resulting profit and acquired (capital) must also include the value of the labor by which it was obtained; without labor it would not have been acquired. A portion of the value whether large or small, comes from the labor.”
 - Profit is the value realised from human labor

Ibn Khaldun

- Political Economy
 - Taxation Policy:
 - Taxation must be equitable and just
 - Otherwise, the government is likely to land itself in trouble
 - “In the beginning of the state, taxes are light in the distribution but considerable in their total and vice versa. The reason is that the state, which follows the ways of religion, only demands the obligation imposed by the Shariah, namely Zakat, Kharaj and Jizya, which are light in their distribution and these are the limits beyond which one must not go.”
 - A balance has to be kept. Excessive taxes may eventually cause more harm than good
 - As societies progress, excessive taxes are levied to help sustain the needs of the rulers, which diminishes the asabiya

Ibn Khaldun

- Political Economy

- Salaries and Allowances:

- When salaries and allowances are cut, the purchasing power is reduced
 - When purchasing power is reduced, there is less economic exchange in markets
 - When there is less economic exchange in markets, there is less incentive for production
 - In totality, this brings the economy and circulation of money to a virtual stop

- Standard of Living:

- If income and expenditure both are high, standard of living is likely to be raised
 - Standard of living directly corresponds to population
 - Higher the population of a city, higher the labour
 - When more labour is available, there is more chance for production to increase
 - This initiates a cycle of economy
 - “With the decrease of population sustenance of a country disappears, springs stop flowing because they require labor, they flow only if dug out and water drawn.”

Ibn Khaldun

- Political Economy

- Livelihood:

- “It should be known that livelihood means the desire for sustenance and the efforts to obtain it.”
 - Livelihood is dependent on the quality and expertise of labour that is being offered
 - A religious cleric may earn less than a craftsman because there are not many buyers for what he wants to offer.

Iqbal

- Allama Muhammad Iqbal (9/11/1877 – 21/4/1938)
- Poet-philosopher
- Key figure of Pakistan movement
- Responsible for the renewal of Muslim “khudi” in subcontinent
- Major works:
 - Development of Metaphysics in Persia, Asrar-e-Khudi , Ramooz-e-Bay-Khudi, Payam-e-Mashriq, Bang-e-Dara
 - Zaboore-e-Ajam, Reconstruction of Religious Thought in Islam, Javed Namah, Bal-e-Jibraeel, Zarb-e-Kaleem, Armughan-e-Hijaz, Ilmul-Iqtisad

Iqbal

- Concept of Khudi (Ego)
 - The concept of “self” or ego had already been touched upon by Nietzsche, William James, Henri Bergson.
 - Iqbal gave it a distinct explanation for the understanding of Muslims
 - Khudi is not pride or arrogance
 - It is self-affirmation, informed individualism, maximization of one’s potential
 - Khudi is a replacement for self-denial that promotes inactivity, escapism and ascetism
 - A process of individualization

Iqbal

- Helpers of Khudi

- Love:

- It means the desire to assimilate, to absorb. Its highest form is the creation of values and ideals and the endeavors to realize them. Love individualizes the lover as well as the beloved. The effort to realize the most unique individuality individualizes the seeker and implies individuality of the sought, for nothing else would satisfy the nature of the seeker.”

- Faqr:

- Overcoming worldly rewards and immediate environment. Once this achieved, there is no limit to further achievements.

- Courage:

- Overcoming and combating all obstacles and hurdles without falling victim to them. Includes both physical and moral courage.
 - Being ready to do what it takes to achieve one’s ideals. Living dangerously, not recklessly

Iqbal

- Helpers of Khudi
 - Tolerance
 - Kasb-e-Hilal
 - lawful and rightful acquisition, anything not obtained by foul means like cheating, fraud or theft, acquiring things or ideas through one's personal efforts and struggles.
 - Creative and original activity
 - Mimicry, ideological enslavement, blind imitation must be done away with.

Iqbal

- Obstacles in the Attainment of Khudi
 - Fear
 - Fear of persons and objects (except God) in all its different phases such as worry, anxiety, anger, jealousy and timidity is a positive danger for ego. It robs man of efficiency and happiness.
 - Beggary
 - Beggary diminishes the individuality of a person, makes him dependent. Includes everything that is not gained through personal effort
 - Slavery
 - Every kind of slavery, whether physical or mental, distorts character and lowers man to the level of a beast and weakens the human ego.
 - Nasab Parasti
 - Pride in one's race or origins

Iqbal

- Iqbal and Nationalism

- Pan-Indian Nationalist Phase

- *Thou see deity in the images of stone,
For me there is deity in every particle of the country's dust
(Naya Shiwala)*
 - Lasted till 1905. Iqbal remained an Indian Nationalist

- Transitional Period

- Can be found in the later parts of Bang e Dara. Started during Iqbal's stay in Europe
 - Exposure to Europe ended his affinity for territorial nationalism
 - Nation-states and territorial nationalism was not meant for Islam

Iqbal

- Iqbal and Nationalism

- Pan-Islamist Phase

- Muslims should unite under one banner
 - Convinced of the virtues of khilafat, Iqbal was convinced that the euro-centric model of nationalism was not applicable to Muslims

- Pakistani Nationalist (Indian Muslim Nationalism) Phase

- “For the present every Muslim nation must sink into her own deeper self, *temporarily* focus her vision on herself alone, until all are strong and powerful enough to form a living family of nations.”
 - The solidarity of the Muslim nations can be strong and fruitful only if these nations unite after having developed into independent and strong nations